



INFORMATION ON EQUALITY AND SOCIAL JUSTICE IN ISRAEL
מידע על שוויון וצדק חברתי בישראל
מרכז «אדפה» – מלומות חול המסוואה ואלעדאלה الالجماعیة فی إسرائیل

**Non-discriminatory hiring practices in Israel
towards
Arab Citizens, Ethiopian Israelis
and new immigrants from Bukhara and the
Caucasus**

**Noga Dagan-Buzaglo
(Attorney, MA Sociology)**

November 2008

מרכז אדוה, ת.ד. 36529, תל-אביב 61364, טל. 03-5608871, פקס. 03-5602205
Adva Center, POB 36529, Tel Aviv 61364, Tel. 03-5608871, Fax. 03-5602205
e-mail: advainfo@bezeqint.net web site: <http://www.adva.org>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction	3
Agents of Non-discriminatory Hiring Practices	6
Non-discriminatory Hiring Practices: Arab Citizens of Israel	11
Non-discriminatory Hiring Practices: Ethiopian Israelis	25
Non-discriminatory Hiring Practices: Immigrants from Bukhara and the Caucasus	35
Non-discrimination and Affirmative Action in Israeli Law	35
Best Practices and Recommendations	39
References	48
Appendices:	
Appendix 1: Countrywide and Regional Organizations Encouraging Non-discriminatory Hiring Practices, by Target Population	52
Appendix 2: Non-discriminatory Hiring Initiatives Undertaken by Government	80
Appendix 3: Non-discriminatory Hiring Initiatives Undertaken by the Business Sector	86

**THIS IS A REPORT SUBMITTED BY THE ADVA CENTER TO THE
COMMISSION ON THE JEWISH PEOPLE, UJA FEDERATION OF NEW YORK.**

INTRODUCTION

The present report examines the main actions taken in the labor market whose effect can be described as "non-discriminatory hiring practices" and "affirmative action," with regard to three social groups whose status in the Israeli work force is especially vulnerable: Arab citizens of Israel, Ethiopian Israelis, and new immigrants from Bukhara and the Caucasus.

For the purposes of this report, we define "non-discriminatory hiring practices" as any activity designed to improve the employment opportunities of a special group: increasing representation in different sectors of the economy, improving representation in managerial positions, increasing wages and promoting employability.

The report distinguishes between two types of action: (1) direct actions, among them vocational training and micro-finance programs, employer incentives, legislation mandating fair representation, and quotas; and (2) policies that have an indirect anti-discrimination bearing, mainly development and infrastructure projects.

The organizations and programs included in the report are the ones operating on the national and regional level. In addition to these, there are numerous local initiatives pursued by local authorities and/or locally organized non-profits, which are not included due to time and budget limitations.

The report concentrates on non-discriminatory hiring, and therefore general educational efforts, such as youth centers or university programs - as they belong to the category of affirmative action in higher education - were not included.

The absence of a political culture of affirmative action

In Israel there is no political culture of affirmative action similar to that which developed in the United States and in other countries, with regard to women, minorities and the disabled.

On one hand, and in contrast to the American history of relations between the white majority and the black minority, in Israel the debate concerning the problems of the largest minority group (aside from women), the Arab minority, has centered on national and political dimensions rather than on social and economic dimensions. The political and intellectual leadership of the Arab minority considers the goal of cultural and political autonomy to be no less important, and perhaps even more important, than the goal of increased

integration into Israeli society by means of affirmative action or non-discriminatory practices.

On the other hand, the State of Israel has bestowed a long series of benefits and preferential treatment on Jewish groups, mainly new immigrants, in areas from housing to education. Special assistance was provided not only at the stage of absorption, but also at later stages, especially for groups that found themselves on the bottom rungs of the socio-economic ladder. These include new immigrants from Arab countries, in the period following establishment of the state, and new immigrants from Ethiopia, during the last two decades. However, the low position of these groups was not perceived as the result of discrimination, but rather as the result of a failure to properly absorb them into Israeli society. Thus, actions designed for their advancement were never defined as affirmative action or as anti-discrimination measures.

This being the case, very little legislation and regulations call for affirmative action. The legal concept of affirmative action was developed mainly for women and persons with disabilities: legislation favoring women in the area of employment exists from the first years of independence, and the employment rights of the disabled have been set down in recent years. It is only in certain sectors of the economy, such as the public service sector, that one finds the terms "adequate representation" or "affirmative action" regarding groups like Arab citizens or Ethiopian Israelis. There are government programs with goals in the areas of development and employment, but these programs do not involve appropriating more resources in compensation for discrimination suffered in the past.

Generally, most of the programs in the area of employment, and especially those created in recent years, constitute part of an effort on the part of the government to increase workforce participation in Israel. This is especially true for the two main groups with low participation rates: Arabs – and especially Arab women – and ultra-Orthodox Jews.

A word about active anti-discrimination policy

At the very outset, a question needs to be asked concerning the nature and benefits of anti-discrimination policy as a strategy for increasing the participation and improving the position of minority groups in the Israeli labor market. Israel has a large variety of groups that in any other country would merit the designation, "in need of anti-discrimination measures or affirmative action": Arab citizens; immigrants from Ethiopia, the Caucasus, and Bukhara; Mizrahi Jews; solo mothers; women; workers over the age of 50; disabled persons – and the list goes on. Indeed, this great variety has led, over the years, to the implementation of programs that could be perceived as political

favoritism, because they favored one or more of the above groups over the rest. Moreover, an active anti-discrimination policy with regard to one group, for example, new immigrants, can be interpreted as exclusion towards another group, for example Arab citizens.

However, in view of the great difficulties some of these groups experience in the job market, active anti-discrimination policy may be the only strategy that has the power to effect change. As such, both anti-discrimination and affirmative action policies may involve a myriad of tactics, including increasing educational and training opportunities, adaptation of universal programs and hiring prerequisites to the needs and limitations of specific groups, increasing the access of targeted groups to the job market, raising the awareness of employers and the general public, legislation, and the setting of quotas.

We view all of these as appropriate, with the exception of quotas. This, because in addition to other well known arguments against quotas, in Israel one could end up setting a quota for each and every group - ad absurdum.

Affirmative action: an Adva anecdote

In June 2008, a female Arab economist began to work at the Adva Center. It took Adva six months to find her. The organization was interested in hiring an Arab woman or man. It first placed an ad in the Shatil "Help Wanted" web site. Then it placed ads in Arab language newspapers, stating a preference for persons whose mother tongue was Arabic. About ten persons answered the ads, but none of them had the requisite qualifications. Then Adva made telephone calls to the academic and administrative heads of MA programs in Economics in Israeli universities, with poor results: there were very few Arab MA students to begin with. Finally, thanks to this research report, Adva learned about the Sikkuy and Mossawa projects to match job seekers with employers, and it placed ads with those organizations. Following a telephone call from Sikkuy, the woman who became an Adva economist sent her CV to the Adva Center. After an interview, she was hired, on the basis of her academic qualifications and the good impression she made at the interview. ***Without Sikkuy, the Adva Center would never have found her and she would never have found Adva Center.***

Methodology

The present report is based on studies and reports published by the government, by civil society organizations and by scholars, as well as on

interviews with decision makers, business people and leaders of civil society organizations. In the course of preparing the report, we uncovered serious limitations regarding the accessibility of information in both the public and the private sectors. The Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment – the main government office dealing with employment - publishes a great deal of information on program budgeting, but very little information on program implementation. The same can be said for the office of the Prime Minister. Another example: the Government Companies Authority publishes figures on the constituencies of boards of directors, but not on the constituency of rank and file employees. Moreover, figures on boards of directors give breakdowns between Jews and Arabs but do not provide information about new immigrants. Of the government corporations to which we turned for information, the only one that was willing to cooperate was the Israel Electric Company, which, it turns out, operates an affirmative action program of its own.

The private sector does not collect figures in any systematic way. It is characterized by lack of transparency, which apparently derives from lack of awareness and fear of public scrutiny. The only information available derives from activities initiated by civil society organizations engaged in monitoring. We turned to ten large and medium-sized firms with a request for information on the employment of Arabs and new immigrants: the request was ignored. Israel has no legislation mandating adequate representation, affirmative action or anti-discrimination initiatives in the private sector. Awareness of the importance of adequate representation is to be found mainly in firms that merged with or were sold to foreign companies, like HP-Indigo.

AGENTS OF NON-DISCRIMINATORY HIRING PRACTICES

The present report will focus on three "agents": the government, the private sector and civil society organizations. Each one is examined below in detail.

Regarding the government, the picture that emerges is that firstly, it has taken some important initiatives to increase the representation of persons from minority groups within its own ranks, but progress is disappointingly slow. Secondly, retrenchment of government responsibility for employment policy is having an adverse effect on planning and coordination.

Regarding the private sector, the idea of affirmative action or active non-discrimination policy is very new; there is no legislation mandating affirmative action and no real practice of affirmative action.

Regarding civil society, firstly, this is the sector that has long been engaged in exposing patterns of discrimination. It also pioneered non-discriminatory hiring practices in Israel, including affirmative action. Secondly, the involvement of civil society in the operation of employment projects targeted at members of minority groups is a relatively new development, triggered by the agendas of organizations that provide funding.

The Government

Among the three agents, the government is the most significant actor, from the standpoint of personnel, allocations and total activity. However, over the last two decades, the government has tended to reduce its budgets and the extent of its activities, and it has transferred a large and growing portion of its responsibility to the private sector and to civil society organizations.

Government expenditure on active labor policies is quite low; in 2007, it amounted to 0.21% of the national product, in contrast to the average of 0.7% for OECD countries (Bank of Israel, 2008, Chapter 5).

Within government, the main body that deals with employment is the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment. Here the two most relevant departments are the Vocational Training Department and the Government Employment Service.

The **Vocational Training Department** has lost most of its budget and personnel. Whereas in the past, tens of thousands of unemployed persons received subsidized training every year, their numbers have been reduced to a few thousand (Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment, Memorandum to the Adva Center, April 1, 2008). Some of the functions of the department were transferred to the "Mehalev " Program ("From Dependency to Self-Sufficiency – also referred to as "The Wisconsin Plan"), operated by private corporations.

The **Government Employment Service** was also downsized. However, a few years ago it was reorganized and began to adopt innovative modes of operation, inspired by those developed by civil society organizations.

To the above departments one should add the **Mati Business Development Centers** of the Israel Small and Medium Enterprises Authority. This is a non-profit organization established by the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment, in which various government ministries, chambers of commerce and business people cooperate. Mati Centers can be found throughout the country, and their purpose is to assist local entrepreneurs. In recent years, Mati Centers have begun to focus on special groups: for example, the center in Hadera assists new immigrants from the Caucasus, the centers in Jerusalem

and B'nei Brak assist ultra-Orthodox Jews, the Netanya center assists Ethiopian Israelis, the Acre center assists Druze, and the center in the Triangle assists Arab citizens. A new center is being set up in Beer Sheba to assist Bedouin citizens of Israel.

The Private Sector

Two aspects of the activities of the private sector are examined: activities promoting the hiring of members of minority groups within private business (affirmative action), and activities that can be defined as the implementation of government projects in the area of employment (outsourcing).

Affirmative Action: Within the private sector, awareness of the need for affirmative action in industrial and commercial firms is in its infancy. In the meantime, the most outstanding actions are two. Firstly, the creation of indicators that rank firms by their actions in the areas of human rights and employment diversity: a social seal awarded by the organization B'ma'aglei Tzedek to businesses that comply with labor laws and provide decent working conditions; the stamp of approval of the Midrug Company/NETA, which examines the numbers of women employed by various corporations in senior managerial positions; and the Maala-Business for Social Responsibility ranking, inspired by the US BSR, based on the criteria of business ethics, human rights, community investment and environment.

Secondly, joint initiatives of non-profits and private employers to promote the hiring of Ethiopian and Arab university graduates. This appears to be a promising direction, both for the placement of minority workers in managerial and senior positions and as a route to advocacy work on behalf of minority groups among employers.

Outsourcing: The single largest program operant in Israel is Mehalev (revised and renamed Orot L'Taasuk), based on US welfare-to-work models. Mehalev is being implemented by four private corporations financed by the state. It is not an affirmative action program; however, it needs to be mentioned because over a third of its participants are new immigrants and about 40% are Arab citizens (National Insurance Institute and Brookdale Institute, 2008: 4). The government is committed to Mehalev, despite the fact that to date its outcomes have not been particularly impressive: it appears that participants who found work while in the program did not improve their income level (Ibid: 15; National Insurance Institute and Brookdale Institute, 2007: 14). It also appears that the main reason for this outcome is that the program does not upgrade participants' workplace skills (Bank of Israel, August 2007: 26). In 2007, the Knesset approved a series of changes in the program (Ibid: 2007). It

remains to be seen if these changes will succeed in making Mehalev an effective instrument of anti-discrimination and affirmative action policies.

Civil Society Organizations

Non-profits play an important role in raising public awareness about employment discrimination. Today, many civil society organizations have shifted their major focus from advocacy work to service provision, becoming sub-contractors of projects designed to find jobs for unemployed persons, to teach job seekers how to apply for jobs, and to conduct vocational training. Some of the projects are the initiatives of the organizations themselves; others are implemented in cooperation with the government and the JDC Tevet program (see below). The extent of the activities of civil society organizations is limited, mainly due to limited resources: the organizations operate on the basis of short-term contracts or private contributions and cannot make long-term commitments.

The second largest project in the area of employment (after Mehalev) is Tevet, an endeavor funded jointly by the government and the JDC. Tevet's goal is to increase the workforce participation of groups with weak connections to the labor market: Arab citizens, ultra-Orthodox Jews, new immigrants, solo mothers and persons with disabilities. Tevet is basically a research and development body that aims to develop new models, in the hope that government agencies will later adopt and finance them (JDC, 2008, *Tevet Employment Initiative Report*). Many of the models employed by Tevet originated with civil society organizations, and most of the actual work in the field is done by civil society organizations. As of November 2008, some 20,000 persons participated in Tevet projects (ibid). Non-profits participating in Tevet as well as Tevet people express serious doubts over whether the Israeli government would eventually adopt and finance Tevet projects. An encouraging development is that the Government Employment Service is currently working to implement two Tevet programs: Strive and Eshet Hayil, and it appears keen to adopt new methods introduced by Tevet. However, the Employment Service's capability is limited by budget restraints and the diversion of many of its former resources to the Mehalev program.

In the framework of the present report, it is difficult to evaluate the various projects implemented by non-profits in the framework of the Tevet program. Such an evaluation would require extensive field work. What we can say is that the advantage of those projects is that all of them involve ways of improving the employability of the participants. It seems to us that the emphasis in any future evaluation of the projects needs to measure their contribution to employability. In the area of job placement, evaluation needs

to focus more on the quality of the job and less on the total number of jobs found.

The most promising and successful programs operating today are programs for outstanding university and college graduates – both Ethiopian immigrants and Arab citizens. These programs, which recruit the elite of each group, are very successful in terms of placement in senior positions and in prestigious firms, and they have an anti stigma effect. However, it is not clear whether promoting the most capable members of minority groups paves the way for the rest of the group or serves as a token goodwill gesture while leaving the majority behind. Current efforts and successes of the programs run by Kav Mashveh, Tebeka and Zinuk B'aliya are not being extended to rank and file workers.

The advantage of non-profits is that they are able to reflect the needs of the specific communities in which they work, to develop new models, and to engage in advocacy on behalf of their constituencies. Today, against the background of government retrenchment in the area of employment, non-profits are increasingly taking on the role of service providers. This is both a positive and a negative development, as there is a danger that increasing service work may be taken on at the expense of grassroots research and development work.

NON-DISCRIMINATORY HIRING PRACTICES: ARAB CITIZENS OF ISRAEL

The inferior position of Arab citizens of Israel in the labor market is the result of long years of discrimination in investments, in budget allocations and in employment practices. The two main problems today are (1) the high concentration of Arab men in blue-collar occupations, and (2) the low labor force participation of Arab women. Before affirmative action can be effective, a number of obstacles need to be removed:

- Discrimination against Arabs in many sectors of the labor market;
- Under-development of physical infrastructure and planning in Arab localities that would support increased employment, such as industrial parks;
- Poor public transportation infrastructure within and between Arab localities;
- A severe lack of day care options – only 5% of Arab infants and toddlers are to be found in day care (Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment, 2004; Shtiwee, 2008).

These obstacles stand in the way of increased participation of Arab citizens in the labor market, whether as employees or as entrepreneurs (Hatib Mahmud and Solomon Shimi, 2006). Women are more adversely affected than men, because the obstacles standing in their way make it impossible or economically unfeasible to enter the workforce (See Shtiwee, 2008).

The government has the greatest capacity to remove the above obstacles. It can also hire more Arab employees in its own departments and agencies.

Non-discrimination policy is conspicuous in its absence in the private sector. However, very recently, several new initiatives have been taken.

Government anti-discrimination initiatives for Arab Citizens

A. Investment in infrastructure in Arab localities

Since the turn of the century, the Israeli government has been quite active in the area of infrastructure development in Arab localities, but actual accomplishments have been less impressive than drawing-board plans. Below are a few examples:

In 2000, the government approved a 4-year plan for industrial development in the Arab sector (Decision 2467 from October 22, 2000). However, the amounts expended amounted to only one-third of the budget allotted to the development of industrial parks, one-fifth of the budget allotted to the development of service and artisan parks, and 65% of the budget allotted to vocational training (Oltzwer, June 2004).

In 2006, a second 4-year plan was announced, to benefit the Arab, Druze and Circassian minorities in the North of the country. The monies allotted were for the planning and development of industrial parks, vocational training, industrial incubators, and the encouragement of new business enterprises. Figures we received from the Director of Minorities in the Office of the Prime Minister for 2006 and 2007 show that all the components of the plan are being implemented, but it is difficult to measure the extent of implementation (Hashem Hussein, head of the Minorities Department in the office of the Prime Minister, personal communication, May 16, 2008). Civil society organizations contend that implementation does not go beyond 75%.

An innovative aspect of the 4-year program that deserves mention here is a program administered by the Ministry of Tourism that involves grants for Druze and Circassian entrepreneurs who set up tourist facilities in their homes (guest houses). The grant is not only for construction but also for marketing and professional training. The program appears to be appropriate for the targeted communities, taking advantage of existing resources to transform them into a source of income.

The office of the Prime Minister and the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment are working to promote the idea of merging industrial parks in Jewish locales with those in Arab locales. Such mergers have a potential for enabling Arab locales to increase their revenues from local taxes, as well as for raising employment levels. The Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment offers financial incentives to the management of Jewish industrial parks that cooperate with Arab locales (www.tamat.gov.il). To date, we can cite only one such project, concerning the Bar-Lev industrial park adjacent to the development town of Carmiel. Here, one Arab locality joined three Jewish ones, with the understanding that the latter would receive 25% of the income. It is still too early to evaluate the venture (Interview with Assaf Adiv, director of Maan, March 25, 2008).

B. Vocational training

In the Department of Vocational Training at the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment, Arab citizens are not on the priority list. However, the Department is party to the programs initiated by the office of

the Prime Minister. In 2006, a total of 2,890 Arab citizens were enrolled in daytime vocational training courses financed by the ministry (Memorandum, Department of Vocational Training, April 1, 2008). This number represents 31% of all recipients of government-subsidized vocational training that year; however, the total number of persons receiving such training has been drastically cut, from over 40,000 in 2000 to less than 5,000 in 2007.

C. Arab citizens employed in the public service

In 2006, Arab citizens constituted 5.9% of public service employees in Israel (Markovich, 2007). This figure is significantly lower than the goal set by the government for 2006 – 8.1%. In its 2006 report, The Public Service Commission found improvement in the recruitment of Arab candidates, but it also found that the pace of improvement was very slow (Awad and Haider, 2008). According to the organization Sikkuy, the chances of a Jewish candidate getting a job through a government tender are twice those of an Arab candidate (Ibid.).

There are many reasons for this situation: firstly, the unfamiliarity of Arab college graduates with the tenders put out by the public service and their hesitancy to enter the competition, due to lack of confidence in the transparency of the proceedings (the proliferation of "fixed tenders" for candidates who already hold positions within the public service or who have good connections); secondly, the difficulty experienced by the public service in finding appropriate Arab candidates; thirdly, limited cooperation among ministry and department heads in the initiative; fourthly, difficulties experienced by Arab candidates in the written examinations and interviews involved in getting a job in the public service.

Following the recommendations of non-profit organizations, in 2006 an inter-ministerial commission was set up to examine ways of increasing the representation of Arab citizens in public service. A year later, the government put out a tender for a firm that would engage in the headhunting of Arab, Druze and Circassian candidates for public service positions. The firm winning the tender is to set up a center for the location, selection and placement of candidates, as well as a computerized database of qualified job seekers (www.civil-service.gov.il). Moreover, a committee is presently examining the public service examinations, to explore the possibility of adapting them to Arab candidates.

In both the public and private sector, even when the organization adopts a non-discriminatory hiring policy, there are difficulties in implementing the policy among medium range managers.

To tackle this problem, Yaser Awad, who is in charge of affirmative action at Sikkuy, suggests that a bigger effort needs to be made to monitor the decisions designed to increase the representation of Arab citizens in the public service, including the possibility of imposing sanctions on ministry and department heads who fail to reach diversification goals (Awad, 2007: 29-32).

D. Boards of directors and Arab employees in government corporations

Government and mixed government/private corporations constitute a significant element in the Israeli economy; in 2006, they employed 64,019 persons – about 2.7% of the total employees (Report of the Government Companies Authority for 2006, website (www.civil-service.gov.il)). In 2003, Arabs were represented on the boards of directors of 33 out of the 116 government corporations, and they constituted 5.9% of members of directorates (Awad, 2007: 20). By February 2008, Arabs constituted 10% of members of directorates (Zohar Sher, deputy director of the Government Companies Authority, memorandum, February 7, 2008).

The representation of Arab employees among rank and file employees of government corporations is lower than that within boards of directors: according to an estimate made by Sikkuy in 2004, Arab employees constituted only 0.7% of the employees, and most of them – 324 in total – were employed in low-level posts (Sikkuy, 2007). Another check, done in 2006, found that Arab employees constituted only 0.6% of employees (Stern and Sinai, March 30, 2008).

Government corporations interested in hiring Arab employees find ways of locating Arab workers. An example was set by the Israel Electric Company in 2006, when it instituted affirmative action hiring practices, under which it placed want ads in Arab-language newspapers that cited a preference for workers from minority groups. The strategy worked: over the last two years, Arabs have constituted between seven and eight percent of new hires. This contrasts with the total representation of Arab employees at Israel Electric – 1.5% - a figure that reflects the absence of affirmative action in previous years.

E. Arabs in the courts

The proportion of Arab citizens employed in the Israeli courts is higher than the proportion employed in public service, despite the fact that the Public Service Law (Appointments) does not apply to judges.

Still, that proportion is quite low, considering the size of the Arab population in Israel and the large number of law school graduates. Figures for 2007 show that among 561 judges serving in Israeli courts, 35 – or 6.2% - were Arabs. Among court management positions, 3% are held by Arabs (Awad and Haider, 2008: 19) Not one Arab is to be found in the committee that selects judges. In April 2003, the first Arab judge, Salim Jubran, was appointed to the Supreme Court (Dichter and Ghanem, 2003).

On March 12, 2006, at the request of the Ministry of Justice, the government made a decision with regard to the fair representation of clerks in the Ministry of Justice. Forthwith, 10% of aspiring attorneys clerking in the Ministry were to be Arabs, Druze, Circassians or Ethiopian Israelis. A tender published by the Ministry of Justice on October 14, 2007, indicates the establishment of a database of candidates from minority groups (www.justice.gov.il).

F. Arabs in higher education

Affirmative action in the Israeli academy is limited to student enrollment and a few MA programs in areas in which there is a shortage of Arab professionals. It is not applied to faculty appointments. The Council for Higher Education, the body responsible for higher education in Israel, prohibits discrimination, but it has no requirements regarding adequate representation or affirmative action on the part of institutions of higher learning. The figures demonstrate a situation of severe under-representation: Arabs constitute no more than one percent of university teachers and a negligible percentage of management (Blachman, 2006).

In 2002, the Planning and Budgeting Committee of the Council for Higher Education discussed the promotion of higher education among Arabs (Council for Higher Education, 2002) including the financing of scholarships for Arab doctoral students and their integration into the faculty. The recommendations are being implemented at a slow pace. Today there is a scholarship program, Ma-of, implemented in cooperation with the Kahanoff Foundation, that subsidizes the hiring of scientists excelling in their studies at universities and public colleges, at the rate of 4-6 for each graduating class (website of Council for Higher Education (www.che.org.il)). Affirmative action legislation may prove stigmatizing to Arab candidates for university faculty positions, but there is definitely a need for a systematic plan to increase the proportion of Arab scholars employed by Israeli universities.

The private sector and non-discriminatory hiring of Arab citizens

Figures on the employment of Arab citizens of Israel in private corporations and businesses are not available and even organizations working with employers, such as Kav Mashveh, are experiencing difficulties obtaining data on rates of employment. This is due, first and foremost, to the lack of awareness on the part of the private sector regarding the issues of adequate representation and affirmative action. The few figures that do exist represent only college graduates.

A. Arab employees in the private sector

The only available figures are from the rankings of Maala.

In 2007, 3.6% of persons employed by companies participating in Maala ranking were Arabs. Corporations that participate in the ranking include the main banks, leading insurance companies and large manufacturing firms.

The Maala figures for 2006 provided a breakdown: 49 companies were ranked: the proportion of Arab employees in private and government companies was 5.3% and that in the companies that trade on the stock exchange, 1.1% (www.maala.org.il).

The public sector – not the private one - is the main employer of Arab college graduates: in 2004, 70% of employed Arab college graduates worked in the public sector (Levy, 2006).

1. Arab college graduates employed in the private sector

The banks – a growing sector of the economy – employ Arabs mainly in the branches located in Arab cities and towns. However, they have also begun to employ Arabs in their central offices. Yet, most positions open to Arab workers are for tellers and reception clerks. Arab workers are less likely to advance within the bank, compared to their Jewish counterparts (Katane, Ibrahim, deputy director-general of Kav Mashveh, interview, June 13, 2008, Tamir Irit, director-general of Kav Mashveh, interview, October 5th, 2008).

The same problem of a glass ceiling exists in the **Cellular Phone companies**, which declare publicly that they promote employees from within the company to senior positions. They recruit many Arab workers as sales representatives and receptionists; however, Arab workers find it extremely

difficult to get promotions and are not represented at all at medium and senior levels. (Tamir, Irit, *ibid.*).

The hi-tech industry – the flagship of the Israeli economy - employs about 9.2% of employed persons, but only about 3% of Arabs in the Israeli labor market (Awad, 2007: 40; Katane, *op cit.*). Approximately 300 Arab engineers are employed in hi-tech, some 150 of them in the Intel Development Center in Haifa and some 50 at the Amadocs Center in the Galilee. (Dailydaily.7/10/08 www.pc.co.il). This disparity had been recognized and there several initiatives to train Arab university graduates in hi-tech professions and assure them of job placements.

The hi- tech industry appears to be a promising area of affirmative action development, for several reasons. Firstly, the industry is constantly in search of talent; secondly, the industry is involved with international corporations which are familiar with and receptive to the international agenda of diversification. Finally, there is clear economic logic to training Arab workers as an alternative to outsourcing work outside of Israel.

2. Arab college graduates employed in manufacturing

Most of the Arabs employed in manufacturing are blue-collar workers. In recent years, an awareness has developed regarding the need to integrate Arabs into the higher echelons of society. This is evidenced in several new initiatives.

Another new initiative to promote the employment of Arab citizens in manufacturing is Kav Mashveh (Employers' Coalition for Equality for Arab College Graduates). Kav Mashveh was set up at the end of 2007 by the Israel Manufacturers' Association, Sikkuy, chambers of commerce, the Israel Bar Association, the Association of Certified Accounts in Israel, the Israel Hotels Association, the Arab Follow-up Committee, the Association of Banks in Israel, the Abraham Fund Initiatives, the Kahanoff Foundation, the Landa Fund, and the UJA Federation of New York - with the aim of promoting the integration of Arab college graduates into the private sector, in positions suitable for their qualifications. The organization is housed at the Manufacturers' Association and is also funded by the Association, by private foundations and by the office of the Prime Minister. Kav Mashveh operates as a placement organization: on the one hand, it provides vocational training and coaching for job-seeking skills, and on the other, it works to promote diversification in hiring in the private sector (Ibrahim Kataneh, deputy director, interview, April 13, 2008). Kav Mashveh adopted a model that was originally developed by civil society organizations – individual coaching and follow-through, adapting training to individual needs, and monitoring integration at the workplace. As

of November 2008, Kav Mashveh has a pool of 200 graduates and a pool of 130 employers offering some 300 positions. (Tamir, Irit, op cit).

A third initiative, Tsofen Elite Technologies Centers, is a non-profit organization founded by business people and persons from the hi-tech field; its aim is to step up the hiring of Arabs in hi-tech firms. It sets up multi-cultural centers in Arab population centers in the Galilee, and it provides Arab college graduates with information about the demands and culture of the hi-tech industry. The declared goal of Tsofen is to increase the number of Arab engineers in the hi-tech industry, from 300 to 1,300 (www.tsofen.org).

Another new initiative, The Arab-Israeli center for Hi Tech and Technology, was established in Nazareth to provide hi-tech training to university graduates in sciences and math and to assist in their placement , in cooperation with Kav Mashveh.

3. Arab managers in the private sector

A 2005 estimate puts the number of Arabs employed in the private sector in jobs defined as senior managerial positions at 2,500, and the number of Jews at 100,000 (Awad, 2007: 42).

Two obstacles stand in the way of Arabs interested in managerial positions in the private sector. The first is the fact that the way to management passes through social and personal networks from which members of minority groups are usually excluded. The second is the common tendency in Israel to give preference to retired army officers for managerial positions. Officers are considered experienced in managing large systems and in implementing large-scale projects; thus they are "natural" candidates for senior management. This tendency has the effect of excluding Arab candidates.

4. Arab citizens in the media

The integration of Arab citizens into the media could help to fight prejudice and discrimination, because of the public exposure they would receive. In the past, the media in Israel was largely public; today it is mostly private. However, the growth and privatization of the media did not lead to a greater integration of Arab citizens into the Hebrew media: in 2006, there were no more than six Arab newscasters (<http://sf.tapuz.co.il/article.391-1-2786-23753>). Most of the Arabs employed in the media work in the Arab media. More are employed in internet and local newspapers, but even there their numbers remain small. According to a survey conducted by the non-profit "Agenda," a total of 25 Arabs are employed in the mainstream Hebrew media, in all positions (Kristal, *Ynet*, October 21, 2007).

According to one recent source, the proportion of Arab journalists employed in the Hebrew media, both national and local, is no more than 0.3% of the total number of journalists (Lensky, October 11, 2007, "The Marker," *Haaretz*).

In 2000, the Citizens' Accord Forum between Jews and Arabs in Israel, composed of Jewish and Arab business people, was organized to promote affirmative action in employment by, among other activities, providing scholarships and training for young Arabs in the field of communications.

In 2007, the Keshet TV Channel initiated a project whose purpose was to train Arab professionals.

5. Changing selection processes in hiring through adaptation of culturally sensitive entry exams and interviews

An important result of the new activity to promote the hiring of Arab university graduates is the recognition that entrance exams and interviews pose a major obstacle for Arab candidates, not only in the public sector but also in the private sector and among manpower and placement agencies. Sikkuy and Kav Mashveh are at present part of a team working with resource managers and manpower agencies to study and adapt selection processes. This is a promising initiative that can enhance the scope of Arab applicants, who in the past have had bad experiences with the selection process.

6. The role of government incentives in promoting diversity in the private sector

Employment initiatives taken by the Ministry of Industry, Trade and Employment include incentives for employers in the periphery of Israel who hire Arab workers – whole or partial sponsorship of hiring costs for a limited period of time. In the past, this initiative was implemented successfully in the case of Soviet scientists immigrating to Israel, yet found to be stigmatizing in the case of Ethiopian immigrants with regard to media positions.

For Arab workers, the initiative was not successful in the Negev, but worked well in Northern Israel. This is especially true for employers hiring a group of minority workers or establishing a branch in Arab localities. The initiative came to an end during 2008; according to Kav Mashveh director Irit Tamir, its renewal is necessary in order to boost the hiring of Arab candidates.

Civil society and non-discriminatory hiring of Arab citizens

Civil society organizations are most active when it comes to anti-discrimination and affirmative action work. Some of these non-profits focus on advocacy and the promotion of better social policies, and others run direct services. Most of the organizations try to combine the two types of activity in their work.

A. Advocacy organizations

Sikkuy, The Association for the Advancement of Civic Equality in Israel

Sikkuy monitors the employment situation of Arab citizens of Israel and public policy regarding the employment of Arab citizens; it also engages in advocacy. Sikkuy publishes an annual report on the representation of Arab citizens in the public service sector, government corporations, and among local authorities. Members of the organization lobby business leaders in order to promote affirmative action and more flexible hiring practices. Sikkuy has a database containing the curriculum vitae of 130 Arab college graduates and an internet column that publishes want-ads. Sikkuy is one of the most active organizations working to put the issue of inequality in employment on the government and public agendas.

Adalah, the Legal Center for Arab Minority Rights in Israel

Adalah works through the courts to reduce structural inequality between Jews and Arabs in Israel. Its most important achievement, perhaps, was the verdict it received following a Supreme Court petition concerning the criteria for bestowment of the status of "national priority area," which involves benefits in the area of education. In the past, the criteria discriminated against the Arab population of Israel: very few Arab localities were considered national priority areas. The case, which dragged on for eight years, ended in a positive verdict in 2006 mandating that the criteria for national preference be egalitarian and that they be set down in basic legislation. Adalah also does considerable work on employment issues.

Mossawa Center

The Mossawa Center works on behalf of the social and economic rights of Arabs in Israel in general, and workplace rights and economic development in particular. Mossawa focuses on advocacy. The Center was also a party to the creation of a monitoring committee on the implementation of the Amendment to the Public Service Law (Appointments). It fights against

discrimination in the labor market, and it has a website that names/blames firms that refuse to hire Arabs. It also works to abolish the criterion of army service as a prerequisite for hiring.

Kayan Feminist Organization

Kayan works to empower Arab women, especially in the field of employment. Its activities include encouraging development policies that will enable Arab women to work outside of the home, organizing empowerment courses for women on employment issues, and legal aid for workplace rights. The organization recently published a report on the mobility problems of Arab women - problems that have a direct and adverse effect on their labor force participation.

Sawt el-Amel - The Laborer's Voice

Sawt el-Amel focuses on legal aid and advocacy on behalf of workers and unemployed persons in the North, mainly Arabs. Sawt el-Amel also works for changes in the terms of entitlement for social security benefits that discriminate against Arab workers. The organization was one of the non-profits that monitored implementation of the Mehalev program in the North of the country, focusing especially on Arab women. Sawt el-Amel also operates a forum for Arab women in the area of employment.

I'Lam – Media Center for Arab Palestinians in Israel

I'lam works in the specific area of communications. Its activities include the training of Arab media people and their integration into mainstream radio stations and TV channels.

Ma'an – Forum for Bedouin Women's Organizations in the Negev

Founded in 2000, this coalition of women from twelve organizations in the Negev engages in advocacy and publishes periodic reports on women's employment issues in the Negev.

Additional civil society organizations working on employment issues

The seven organizations described above: Sikkuy, Adalah, Mossawa, Kayan, Sawt el Amel, I'Lam, and Ma'an – focus on improving employment policies and defending the rights of Arab workers.

There are additional organizations in Israel that engage in activities on behalf of Israeli workers in general, but devote special attention to Arab workers. A partial list of those organizations includes Kav Laoved, the Association for Civil Rights in Israel, Itach – Women Lawyers for Social Justice, Yedid – the Association for Community Empowerment, and the Adva Center.

Kav Laoved is one of the oldest non-profits working in the area of workers' rights; it focuses on marginal groups, including Palestinian workers, Arab workers, foreign migrant workers, and workers employed by perm-temp agencies.

The Association for Civil Rights in Israel concentrates on legal action and legal advocacy. Among other issues on its agenda is the right to equality of opportunity. The Association was a pioneer in anti-discrimination litigation on behalf of Arab citizens of Israel and has achieved quite a number of important precedents.

Itach engages in legal activity and advocacy in the field of employment. It provides legal aid and consultation and has mixed Jewish-Arab women's groups.

Yedid operates rights and empowerment centers for low-income Israelis throughout the country, including Arab localities.

The Adva Center monitors inequality in general, including in the area of employment. Most of its reports devote considerable attention to the situation of Arab citizens.

Two coalitions of diverse organizations working together on workplace issues also deserve mention: **The Forum for the Enforcement of Labor Rights** and **The Women's Budget Forum**. The 2007 program of the latter coalition focused on advocacy to remove obstacles standing in the way of employment opportunities for Arab women

B. Organizations Providing Services

Alongside the above organizations, whose major focus is on policy advocacy, individual advocacy or legal work, there are civil society organizations that focus mainly on providing direct services. These non-profits conduct employment projects, either on their own or as sub-contractors for Tevet. Their importance is growing, in light of the downsizing going on in the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment, which includes a downsizing of vocational training programs.

Maan – Workers' Advice Center

Maan strives to find work placements for Arab men and women. It focuses on blue-collar workers and workers in the service industries. It also does intensive lobbying for the hiring of Arabs in agriculture and construction, instead of

hiring migrant workers from abroad. Since 2005, Maan has been serving as an intermediary between Jewish farmers and Arab agricultural workers, mainly females. The basic strategy of the organization is to recruit workers for employers, in exchange for decent working conditions. Maan works to empower Arab women at the workplace, using a model similar to that employed by other non-profits (see below): concentrating on traditional crafts and turning them into a source of livelihood through the creation of small businesses and cooperatives.

Al Ahali Center for Community Development

Al Ahali, situated in the Galilee, works for the development of Arab agriculture, to make it a viable source of income. Al Ahali founded an association of Arab farmers, the aim of which is to upgrade their products and production. Al Ahali also works with women employed in agriculture. The focus is on creating small businesses involving traditional agricultural products, like olive oil and herbs.

Jewish-Arab Center for Economic Development

The Jewish-Arab Center works to promote business enterprises. For example, the Center organized - in conjunction with the Rahat branch of Yedid - a course for the encouragement of employment and entrepreneurship among young women. The Center also works to foster networking among Jewish and Arab business people. In 1999 it established a club for Arab business persons, which today operates as a separate non-profit organization. It recently established an association of Jewish and Arab businesswomen, called Yasmin, whose purpose is to provide support and empowerment. Today, the activities of Yasmin involve 300 women.

Economic Empowerment for Women

Economic Empowerment operates a project entitled "A Business of Her Own," in which - in conjunction with the Mati Centers, local social service departments and other non-profit organizations - it conducts empowerment courses, runs a micro-finance program, and mentors women who wish to open small businesses. The project is intended for poor women with limited education and funds. The model used by Economic Empowerment, which encourages the creation of small businesses to reduce poverty, has been implemented with success in many parts of the world. It has many advantages – it makes use of traditional skills and includes the option of working at home – along with disadvantages – it is unstable and extremely sensitive to market fluctuations. The level of income derived from small businesses is quite low, often less than the minimum wage. Thus, while small businesses lessen women's dependence on government aid, they do not

necessarily improve women's standard of living. Economic Empowerment advocates for a government micro-finance instrument suitable to women, especially Arab women who are ineligible for ordinary bank loans.

Mahut Center – Information, Guidance and Employment for Women

Mahut Center conducts workshops and training courses for women seeking employment. Its model involves not only training but also empowerment workshops, job placement, and individual monitoring before and after job placement. Mahut Center focuses on poor women, Arab women and women over the age of forty.

Negev Institute for Strategies of Peace and Development and Ajeek Arab-Jewish Center for Equality, Empowerment and Cooperation

The Negev Institute advocates for developing the Negev and for peace-making between Jews and Arabs on a grassroots level. One of its projects is Ajeek, which focuses on economic empowerment and community development for Bedouins in the Negev. Under the auspices of the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment and the JDC, the Negev Institute/Ajeek conducted an employment survey of Bedouins in the Negev. Ajeek serves as a sub-contractor of Tevet, conducting, among others, vocational training courses for Bedouin women, establishing a club for Bedouin businesswomen, and setting up a cooperative for Bedouin farmers.

Sidrih for the Promotion of Women and Family in Arab Bedouin Society in the Negev

Sidrih is a local initiative in the Bedouin town of Lakiya. Since 1991, it has been operating a weaving workshop for women. Recently the workshop has added the making of traditional jewelry to its repertoire.

NON-DISCRIMINATORY HIRING PRACTICES: ETHIOPIAN ISRAELIS

There are approximately 110,000 Ethiopian Israelis living in Israel today. The weakness and vulnerability of this social group stems first and foremost from its absolute and continuing dependence on state institutions, following aliyah to Israel. Ethiopian immigrants came with a low level of education and without financial resources (Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment, 2007: 16-17). The main problems of Ethiopian Israelis, when it comes to the labor market, are (1) low workforce participation on the part of women (42% - lower than the workforce participation of Jewish women but higher than that of Arab women), (2) a high percentage of employment in occasional service jobs, and (3) the difficulties encountered by college graduates in finding jobs suitable for their chosen areas of study. One of the consequences is a high poverty rate – 51.7% - a rate similar to that of the Arab population of Israel (54.8%).

Many agencies are engaged in activities designed to improve the situation of Ethiopian Israelis: the central government, local governments, and civil society organizations. Usually these activities are undertaken without coordination and without combining resources, and without providing a single address for Ethiopian Israelis. In 1999, the Israeli government decided to pool its activities into a central headquarters, but the decision failed to be implemented (State Comptroller, *2008 Report*, Chapter 4). Since the 1990s, organizations founded by Ethiopian activists have proliferated; they play an important intermediary role between the Ethiopian community and government agencies. As such, they monitor government activities and insist that Ethiopian Israelis be represented at both planning and implementation stages.

In the area of employment, the main activities are now being carried out in the framework of the Tevet project. Ethiopian Israelis also constitute part of the clientele of the Mehalev program. In addition there are three important programs for university graduates initiated and run by non-profits, in cooperation with private sector institutions.

The Five-Year Employment plan

On paper, where it still remains, the potentially most significant program of recent years was the creation, in March 2008, of a 5-year employment plan. The plan was created by the central government, in cooperation with Ethiopian Israelis, and it is more culturally appropriate than plans made in the past without the involvement of representatives from the Ethiopian

community. The plan includes setting up a single headquarters to coordinate all activities and to pool all resources. At the same time, it needs to be said that past experience has shown that the central government has a poor record of implementing plans of this type, as well as a history of diverting dedicated resources to other projects.

In the following pages, we examine the main non-discriminatory programs for Ethiopian immigrants being undertaken today - by the government, by the private sector and by non-profit organizations. There is a large variety of such programs, most of which are being carried out by civil society organizations, many of them in the framework of Tevet.

Government non-discriminatory initiatives for Ethiopian Israelis

A. From focus on blue-collar workers to focus on college grads

Two master plans guided the activities of the government in its original absorption plans for Ethiopian immigrants, the first from 1985 and the second from 1991. Both plans focused on providing vocational training as the major instrument of integration of the new immigrants into the workplace. Prior to 1995, the government and organizations like the JDC and the Jewish Agency devoted considerable resources to this strategy. Thousands of Ethiopian Israelis – mainly men – underwent vocational training. After 1995, vocational training became less central (Walda-Tsadik, 2003). However, new efforts are now being made to integrate Ethiopian Israelis into the labor market as part of the Tevet initiative and through independent programs led by civil society organizations.

In the first years after immigration, most of the programs for Ethiopian Israelis applied to unskilled workers. It is only recently that the difficulties experienced by college graduates have received attention, following the successful policy of affirmative action in higher education, which led to an increase in the number of Ethiopian college graduates to over 3,000. However, most college graduates do not work in their fields of study: in 2004, only 44% were employed in professions suitable to their qualifications; in the general population, the percentage is 61% (Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews, February 14, 2006, www.iaej.co.il).

B. Government programs for training and placement

Ethiopian Israelis, together with Russian Israelis, constitute over 30% of the participants in Mehalev, designed for unemployed persons receiving income support payments. The civil society organizations monitoring the plan point out that Ethiopian Israelis have a number of specific problems, including the lack of understanding of persons running and implementing the program with regard to their cultural needs and the absence of translators for immigrants who do not speak Hebrew. Participants who do not comply with the strict rules of Mehalev risk losing their rights as new immigrants to vocational training or to Hebrew language instruction.

1. The Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment

The Department for Vocational Training has a few special programs for Ethiopian Israelis, undertaken in cooperation with civil society organizations, with for-profit bodies, and with Tevet. The Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment does not publish figures regarding the participation of Ethiopian Israelis in vocational training courses. Interviews with Ethiopian Israelis active in non-profit organizations present a picture of limited activity, due to the small number of courses offered and to the prerequisite of 10 to 12 years of schooling.

- In absorption centers, the Jewish Agency has a program designed for unskilled immigrants, operated until this year with the non-profit organization **Be-Atzmi**, which included learning basic concepts from the world of work and help in finding a job.
- Several dozen Ethiopian Israelis participate in a special program for persons who have been unemployed for two years and who are not eligible for regular vocational training programs, run by the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment.

2. The Ministry of Absorption

According to leaders of Ethiopian non-profit organizations, the Ministry of Absorption's activities have had no more than a marginal effect, despite the fact that considerable resources were invested in them.

Ministry figures do not differentiate between Ethiopian Israelis and other immigrants. It appears that the most significant programs for Ethiopian Israelis are the six vocational guidance centers scattered throughout the country. Other programs that deserve mention include the Employment Vouchers program, which provides payment for vocational training, as well as the program involving micro-loans and mentoring for small businesses. The Vouchers program for new immigrants was restricted to immigrants who arrived in the last 5 years, making it irrelevant for most Ethiopians as the

majority is more veteran, and the newcomers lack the language capacity to utilize it. Recently it was amended to include Ethiopians who arrived during the last 15 years.

C. Ethiopian Israelis employed in public service

In July 2005, an amendment was made to the Public Service Law (Appointments) stipulating affirmative action for Ethiopian Israelis competing for public service jobs. The amendment was an attempt to level the playing field when it became apparent that Ethiopian Israelis, including college graduates, had a hard time with the entrance exams required for public service jobs, even if they had held senior positions before applying (Interviews with Segal Shelach ,JDC, April 30, 2008, and with Danny Admaso, director of IAEJ, March 16, 2008). Like Arab citizens, Ethiopian Israelis do not usually apply for public service jobs, under the assumption that many positions are only open to persons with good connections (Danny Admaso, director of the Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews, March 16, 2008).

In December 2006, 504 Ethiopian Israelis held public service jobs; they comprised about one percent of all public service employees. Ethiopian Israelis comprise 1.5% of the population of Israel. Thus, the proportional representation of Ethiopian Israelis in the Israeli public service sector is better than that of Arab citizens of Israel, who comprise nearly 20% of the population but comprise only 5.9% of public service employees. The downside is that most Ethiopian Israelis work in clerical jobs that do not require a college degree (Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews, 2008, www.iaej.co.il).

In 2007, a number of steps were taken to promote the hiring of Ethiopian Israelis in the Israeli public service sector:

- In February 2007, the State Public Service Commissioner instructed the directors-general of government ministries and related agencies to institute the practice of affirmative action for candidates from social groups lacking adequate representation, among them Ethiopian Israelis.
- In May 2007, the government resolved to employ 15 Ethiopian Israelis in senior management positions in government ministries and agencies. The Ministry of Absorption and the Public Service Commissioner developed a basket of incentives for ministries hiring Ethiopian Israelis, at a cost of about NIS 2.5 million (Press Release, Ministry of Absorption, May 13, 2007).
- A decision was made to set up a joint committee, composed of members from the Public Service Commission and the Ministry of Absorption, to consider what could be done about the examinations

given to aspiring candidates. One of the suggestions entertained was to translate the exams into Amharic. The committee has not yet submitted its recommendations (Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews, 2008)

D. Ethiopian Israelis employed by the National Insurance Institute

A common way to integrate persons from minority groups into the public service sector is to hire them to work in institutions that provide services to their communities. Since a good number of Ethiopian Israelis depend on the National Insurance Institute, the institution is a prime candidate for affirmative action. However, to date the results are not particularly impressive. In 2004, only about four percent of employees were new immigrants. In a new branch opened in Ashdod, a city of 220,000 residents, 72,000 of them new immigrants, only two part-time positions (out of 50 positions) were reserved for new immigrants, one for a Russian speaker and the other for an Amharic speaker.

E. Ethiopian Israelis employed by the police force

In September 2008, 560 Ethiopians out of 28,000 were employed in the police forces. Only 9 of them were officers. Recently a new cooperative effort was initiated between the police and the Ministry of Absorption to increase the recruitment of Ethiopians. The need to increase representation in the police is especially important and follows complaints from the Ethiopian community about police abuse of Ethiopian youth. The ministry assists candidates by providing them with access to Hebrew and entry exam preparation.

F. 5-year Integration Program for the Absorption of Ethiopian Immigrants:

In March 2008, the government approved the 5-year program for the absorption of Ethiopian immigrants. The program is to be multi-disciplinary, and it is to include the areas of employment, education, higher education, the army, housing and welfare. The plan largely targets young people aged 16 to 35. It was budgeted at NIS 870 million.

Regarding employment, the plan includes vocational training and career retraining for college graduates, vocational counseling prior to vocational training, matriculation exam completion/improvement services, individual mentoring both during and after job placement, the establishment of vocational guidance centers, and the expansion of support activities (day care and after-school frameworks).

As of October 2008, there are no signs of implementation of this plan.

Private sector non-discriminatory initiatives for Ethiopian Israelis

The private sector employs Ethiopian Israelis mainly in the service industry and in low and medium tech manufacturing. According to Israel Manufacturers' Association figures, some 4,900 Ethiopian Israelis are employed in manufacturing, mostly in textiles, food processing, metals and electricity, plastics, paper, footwear and printing: 59% are skilled workers and 33% unskilled.

Ethiopian Israelis, including college graduates, have a hard time getting jobs in the fastest-growing industries, foremost among them hi-tech, partially due to their lack of social connections. Another obstacle appears to be the examinations that placement agencies administer to candidates for employment in hi-tech.

In 2007, a conference was held for industrialists on the issue of integrating Ethiopian Israelis into manufacturing. The chairman of the Manufacturers' Association agreed to help set up a Forum involving the Association, the Ministry of Absorption, the Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews, Tabeka-The Legal Center for Ethiopian Israelis, and the North American Conference on Ethiopian Jews. Subsequently, the Forum developed a program for the in-plant training of unskilled workers in areas in which there is a shortage – metal working, computer micro-chips processing, tailoring, and machining. The Forum set the goal of hiring 1,000 Ethiopian Israelis in manufacturing firms within five years. In August 2007, the first course in metal welding opened its doors, in Ashkelon. The advantage of this course is that it does not involve the revoking of income maintenance, as is the practice with programs of the Vocational Training Department of the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment. However, it channels Ethiopian Israelis into vocations often characterized by low salaries, into which it is difficult to attract veteran Israelis (Danny Admaso, director IAEJ, February 20, 2008, <http://www.prot2port.co.il>).

A. Ethiopian Israelis employed by the media

The integration of Ethiopian Israelis into the media has the potential of breaking down stereotypes, due to the visibility of the profession. Two initiatives were undertaken in this area. One involved training and hiring Ethiopian Israelis in journalism, an idea propounded by the Israel Association

for Ethiopian Jews; the Association provided scholarships for students who were to be subsequently hired by the Keshet TV channel. The second involved the financing, by the Ministry of Absorption, of the salary of an Ethiopian Israeli at the Public Broadcasting Authority. Both initiatives failed, first of all, because the profession is characterized by a high turnover and there is no such thing as tenure. Secondly, it appears that the employees who got their jobs through special help were stigmatized.

A third initiative was taken by Anat Saragusty, a senior Israeli journalist, who created a one-year course for aspiring Ethiopian journalists and community activists, which is presently in its second round. Ethiopian journalists who managed to find work in the media are graduates of this course.

B. Ethiopian Israelis employed in hi-tech

Hi-tech is at the vanguard of the Israeli economy and pays high salaries. The proportion of Ethiopian Israelis employed in hi-tech is negligible.

A recent initiative aims to change this situation. The project is the dream of one man, Asher Elias, who set up the non-profit organization Tech Career, which trains college graduates to work in hi-tech. The project involves cooperation with the John Bryce Corporation, the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment, and the Training Department of the Matrix corporation. The program involves a year of intensive studies, in a boarding school setting, at the end of which participants receive certificates from John Bryce and Microsoft. The project includes the guarantee of a job. Several dozen persons have already graduated with jobs waiting for them. Similar courses are offered today by Neter, a non-profit organization run by hi-tech people, and Meir Panim, an Orthodox charity.

C. Banks

Thanks to the project "Progressing Together" (Zinuk B'aliya), which places and trains excellent university graduates, there are at present a total of six Ethiopian managers in the Hapoalim Bank and another six in the Leumi Bank. Several Ethiopians are engaged at lower levels, as bank tellers, mainly in Jerusalem (October 5th 2008. interview with Ifat Ovadia, manager of "Progressing Together").

D. Law firms

Successful affirmative action in higher education has resulted in several dozens of law school graduates of Ethiopian origin. Yet, most of them find it hard to find jobs. Over the last three years, thanks to the activity of Tebeka and "Progressing Together" and the cooperation of the Israeli Bar association, approximately 50 Ethiopian law school graduates found jobs in law firms and in legal departments in banks and corporations; there are at present 45 students doing their clerking (www.tabeka.org.il; www.israelbar.org.il). The most significant achievement was their integration into leading, prestigious firms. However, it is still almost impossible for Ethiopian graduates to find law positions unaided; the mediation of NGOs is still essential.

Civil society and non-discriminatory initiatives for Ethiopian Israelis

Several self-help organizations for Ethiopian Israelis are active today in the area of employment. The most prominent are the **Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews** and **Tabeka** – the Center for Legal Aid and Advocacy for Ethiopian Israelis. In the past, these organizations focused mainly on advocacy and legal rights; today, they also operate employment programs of their own.

As many of the non-discriminatory employment actions for Ethiopian Israelis are conducted under the auspices of Tevet, we review several of these programs below, including the non-profits involved in their implementation. The programs are of two kinds: programs for persons without workplace skills and programs for college graduates.

A. Tevet programs for persons without workplace skills

Eshet Hayil. This program is designed for Ethiopian as well as Circassian women who lack familiarity with the Israeli workplace. The sub-contractors are the **Israel Women's Network** and **Be-Atzmi**-Personal Initiative Towards Employment. The purpose of the project is to provide women with employment support services. In every locality in which the project operates, a coordinator is responsible for providing assistance on an individual level – helping a woman find a job, monitoring her progress, and maintaining contact with her employer. The project operates in 16 localities, involving 1,300 Ethiopian Israeli women who are unemployed and do not receive income maintenance payments. According to JDC figures, by the end of 2005, 1,449 women had found jobs – 70% of those who sought employment (JDC, 2008). An equivalent program for men, Avihayil, was also initiated.

Edit, a program for solo mothers, many of whose participants are new immigrants, introduces opportunities for completing a high school education

and provides guidance on how to find a job. The Edit program is unique in that it provides support services such as financing for transportation and child care, and it has been cited as successful in increasing women's employment opportunities and job placements (Amzaleg-Bahar and Yafe- Argaz, 2006). The program is a cooperative effort of the JDC, the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment, local authorities and community centers.

Reshet Employment Incubators, a project for persons receiving income maintenance payments who are not eligible for regular vocational training due to their low educational achievements. It includes basic training in Hebrew and arithmetic and preparation for work in gardening, nursing care or assembly-line work.

Independence is a three-year program for new immigrants from Ethiopia and Bukhara, which targets whole families. It provides assistance with education, health and employment. The bodies involved in implementation of the program include the Ministry of Social Affairs, the Ministry of Absorption, local authorities, local NGOs, Tevet, the JDC and the Congress of Bukharan Jews.

Kedma, a program for singles aged 17-25 who have not yet immigrated to Israel, seeks to smooth their transition to school, college or vocational training. Today the program has 300 participants in six different localities (IAEJ, July 5, 2007, www.iaej.co.il). Bodies involved in the program include government ministries and the Student Administration.

Telem. A project of the kibbutz movement, in conjunction with the Ministry of Absorption, Telem was initiated in 1998 for demobilized soldiers. It involves a year of study and vocational training, during which participants live on kibbutz. The aim is to prepare young Ethiopian Israelis for full-time employment. Each year some 80 young people take part, and the program is very much in demand.

In addition to the Tevet program, other employment initiatives for Ethiopian Israelis include the day-to-day work of **Fidel** mediators in finding jobs and the project run by **Ahoti**-For Women in Israel. The latter project involves turning traditional crafts – embroidering, weaving, ceramics-making – into an income-producing venture (www.achoti.org.il).

B. Programs for college graduates

Keys to Success: A Program for the Integration of University Graduates from the Ethiopian Community

A joint project of the **Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews** and **Yedid**, the undertaking includes teaching college graduates how to write curriculum vitae, creating a website to connect employers with job seekers, and establishing an Employers' Council, charged with persuading additional employers to hire Ethiopian Israelis.

Olim for Law and Justice

Olim is a project implemented by **Tabeka** under the auspices of Tevet to help Ethiopian Israelis graduating from law schools find clerking positions. The organization reports that its success rate is about 40%, and that most graduates who find clerking positions later find jobs (JDC, 2008).

Bandley Woodley (Progressing Together)

This project is for Ethiopian college students who excel in their studies, and its purpose is to help them to secure senior positions in the Israeli economy. At the same time, the idea is to create a new leadership stratum that will break down employers' stereotypes and serve as a model for young people. The program was created by **Tabeka** but is now being implemented by an organization created especially to run the program: **Zinuk B'Aliyah**. The program aims to provide help in finding jobs and runs an annual enrichment program held at the Herzliya Multi-Disciplinary College. In 2007, the project boasted 32 graduates employed in prestigious workplaces (accounting firms, law offices, banks and the public service). The program is funded by private foundations.

NON-DISCRIMINATORY HIRING PRACTICES: IMMIGRANTS FROM BUKHARA AND THE CAUCASUS

Immigrants from the Caucasus

New immigrants from the Caucasus came to Israel in two waves: about 12,000 immigrants came at the end of the 1970s and at the beginning of the 1980s, and an additional 60,000 immigrants arrived during the 1990s. The majority of both the men and the women were gainfully employed prior to aliyah (between 80% and 90%), mostly as salaried persons. The men were employed mainly as skilled laborers in manufacturing and construction, and the women were employed mostly as clerical or service workers, with a small minority working in the free professions. Some made their living from businesses based on seasonal and occasional opportunities. After perestroika, more started their own businesses (King, Alnavogen-Frankowitz, Sorek and Dolev, 2005). Today Caucasian immigrants and their offspring number about 120,000 persons.

In 1997, Caucasian immigrants had relatively low workforce participation rates: 57% for the men and 43% for the women, half of them in unskilled labor. Only four percent found jobs in the academic, technical and free professions, compared with 26% who had held such positions prior to immigration (Ibid.).

In 2002, the number of unemployed persons was still relatively high, but a change occurred in the employment pattern of women. While in 1997, 73% of the women were employed as skilled or unskilled laborers, in 2002, 41% worked as skilled or unskilled laborers, and 40% were doing clerical or sales work (Habib, 2005).

When it comes to education, Caucasian immigrants and their offspring have relatively few years of schooling, low success rates in the matriculation examinations, and a high drop-out rate in high school: in 1997, 25% of 14-17 year-olds were not in school, compared with 5.5% for the Jewish population as a whole. In 2002, 14% were enrolled ultra-Orthodox private schools, and 6% were not enrolled in any school (King et al, op. cit.,2005).

Immigrants from Bukhara

There is little information available concerning Bukharan immigrants and their offspring, and we did not find any recent figures on their employment

patterns. Israel has a long-standing Bukharan community that preceded the establishment of the State. However, most Bukharans arrived in two waves, one in the 1970s and the other at the beginning of the 1990s. The new immigrants live in the center of the country, in the following localities: south Tel Aviv, Jaffa, Ramle, Jerusalem, Or Yehudah, Kiryat Malachi, Shderot, Ashdod, Lod, Netanya, and Bat Yam. Acre. According to the World Congress of Bukharan Jews, the community numbers about 150,000 persons. Most Bukharans are traditionally religious; some are connected with the Chabbad movement; others study in the state religious schools, in Agudah Yisrael schools and in yeshivas.

Government non-discriminatory initiatives for immigrants from Bukhara and the Caucasus

The relevant actors here are the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment, the Ministry of Absorption, the Ministry of Social Affairs, the Urban Renewal programs and local authorities. The most prominent is the Ministry of Absorption.

It was only in the mid 1990s that immigrants from Bukhara and the Caucasus were identified as a group in need of promotion. Below are the actions initiated.

- In 1995, an inter-ministerial committee was set up to develop special programs for integration of the immigrants into Israeli society (King et al. op. cit, 2005). It was decided to define Caucasian immigrants and their offspring as a special group and to give it special privileges, like increasing the duration of the period during which they would be entitled to immigrant rights to ten years and providing special assistance to students. In addition, in recent years, local authorities have begun to operate special programs in the areas of education and employment (King et al, op cit, 2005). Official policy was to integrate members of the community into an employment program; however, the community is very closed, and it has not produced a significant stratum of community workers that could be recruited to work on such a program.
- In 1998, the Ministry of Absorption set up a department for the absorption of Bukharan immigrants, and in 1999 this group was made a priority population. The same year, a Cabinet committee chaired by Minister Nathan Sharansky decided on special help for Bukharan immigrants making aliyah in 1990 or afterwards. This help consists mainly of broadening assistance for the new immigrants, creating affirmative action programs in the areas of education and

employment, bestowing priority status in admittance to vocational training courses in academic and well as non-academic professions, and establishing a special course in workplace Hebrew (website of MK Amnon Cohen, www.amnoncohen.com/parliament.php).

- Mati centers developed special programs for new immigrants, among them new immigrants from Bukhara and the Caucasus. Since the end of the 1990s, Mati Hadera has been running national projects for Caucasian immigrants, whose manager is a Caucasian immigrant. In the first years of its operation, this program for encouraging small businesses was carried out in cooperation with the Caucasian Student Association.
- Since 2002, the Ministry of Absorption, in conjunction with the JDC, has been conducting a community leadership program for Bukharan and Caucasian immigrants, whose purpose is to develop strata of young activists in localities with high concentrations of new immigrants. The success of the program in creating local leaderships is under dispute, but it appears that positive effects of the program include the creation of opportunities for volunteer work and increasing the motivation of young people to go to college (Amzaleg, Bahar and Yafe-Argaz, 2006).

Today most programs for Bukharan and Caucasian immigrants operate in the framework of Tevet, in cooperation with organizations that are not identified with the communities themselves, like the **Israel Women's Network, Be-Atzmi**, and "A Business of Her Own," the latter operated by **Economic Empowerment for Women** in Haifa. The activities undertaken in the framework of Tevet include preparation for entering the labor market, guidance on how to set up a small business, and programs for continuing education and vocational training. According to the database of the Ministry of Absorption, in 2006 some 5,000 new immigrants from Bukhara and the Caucasus participated in one of these programs (JDC, Immigrant Absorption Department, 2007).

The Tevet initiatives manage to overcome the difficulties encountered by the government programs – the closed, tight-knit family-based nature of the community and suspicion toward the authorities. The emphasis in the Tevet programs is on recruitment and marketing, which is done by persons from the community itself, who turn to family heads when it comes to educational and employment programs for women. In fact, the most successful programs are those designed for women – Eshet Hayil and Edit, a program for solo mothers that presents opportunities for completing a high school education and guidance on job seeking. Another program cited in connected with immigrants from the Asian republics is "Independence," which works with the whole family for a period of three years, with the aim of improving integration into the Israeli education, health and employment systems.

Private sector non-discriminatory initiatives for immigrants from Bukhara and the Caucasus

In contrast to Ethiopian immigrants, immigrants from Bukhara and the Caucasus are not seen by the general public as distinct groups, but rather as immigrants from the former Soviet Union. The private sector has no affirmative action activities designed for immigrants from the Russian republics, since as a whole, their integration in the area of employment has been relatively successful.

Civil society non-discriminatory initiatives for immigrants from Bukhara and the Caucasus

In the non-profit sector, the JDC and the immigrant associations are the major actors. The immigrant associations, led by community dignitaries and financed by community businessmen, act as charitable organizations, as is traditional in Jewish communities around the world. The associations have websites and newspapers that deal with the community and the activities of the associations themselves. They have a personals section, news and features about cultural events and also (limited) information about employment and welfare. In the area of employment, there are want-ads, lists of job seekers, and liaison between employers and employees. The associations are independent; they also receive funding from the Ministry of Absorption, but they are not party to government programs. An exception is the Caucasian Student Association and the Covenant of Bukharans in Israel, which cooperate with the Ministry of Absorption to assist students. The immigrant associations operate without transparency, and requests for information are met with suspicion. Periodic financial and narrative reports are not published, as they are by most Israeli non-profit associations. No information is given over the telephone.

World Congress of Bukharan Jews. The Congress was established by Lev Levaiev, who remains the moving spirit to this day. The Congress serves as a roof organization for the Bukharan community in Israel and deals with problems like social welfare, religion and synagogues, children, schooling and higher education, folklore and heritage. The Congress employs some ten regional coordinators. In the area of employment, the Congress cooperates with the local government in Ramle to operate an employment center for Bukharans, which mediates between workers and employers. In Bat Yam, the Congress cooperates with the Social Services Department, which conducts special courses for Bukharan immigrants.

The congress is a partner in the implementation of the Tevet "Idit" program for solo mothers.

Covenant of Bukharans in Israel. The organization was set up in 1972 to represent the community in Israel. It gives financial assistance, information, and counseling, and puts on social and cultural functions. In 2005 it began operating an employment center, serving as an intermediary between workers and employers. It presently offers workshops that prepare job seekers for work interviews (Shoshana Ron, director, personal communication, March 30, 2008).

Association of Caucasian Jews, 2006. This is a non-profit run by young people, some of them graduates of the Caucasian Student Association. The creation of this organization is an attempt to replace the old-time leadership, seen as politically motivated rather than as interested in truly representing the community's needs.

Leah. The organization was created and is managed by Rina Abramov-Pesachov, formerly active in JDC activities. It offers empowerment courses, a fitness club, Hebrew ulpans, vocational training and afternoon activity frameworks for the children of working women. The only information on the organization is on the following website. The writer was unable to locate either the director or an office (http://www.sheatufim.org.il/page-he.asp?pid=168&parent_id=101).

Keshev is an organization that states that it works to integrate young people from the Caucasian community into areas of higher education, military service and employment. It was created by young people. The writer was unable to make contact with the organization.

NON-DISCRIMINATION AND AFFIRMATIVE ACTION IN ISRAELI LAW

The prohibition of discrimination is well anchored in Israeli law. Yet, non-discriminatory hiring practices and affirmative action are not an integral part of the Israeli political and legal tradition; programs, laws and regulations concerning active anti-discrimination policy are a very new constituent of legal and political activity in the area of employment.

Requirements with regard to affirmative action and adequate representation are to be found only in instructions connected with specific laws. The

reference is to amendments first passed in the middle of the 1990s, designed to introduce affirmative action and adequate representation into public service and government corporations - with regard to women, Arab citizens and Ethiopian Israelis. It should be mentioned that such requirements are limited, for two reasons: firstly, they are worded in the most general way, without referring to rank or function, and secondly, they refer only to the public sector and not to the private one. Following are the main requirements:

- Article 18A (1993) of the Government Companies Law of 1975, which requires adequate representation of women and men on boards of directors of government corporations;
- Amendment 7 (1995) to the Public Service Law (Appointments) of 1959, which requires adequate representation of women and men in the public service;
- Amendment 11 (2000) to the Public Service Law (Appointments), which mandates fair representation for Arab citizens in the public service sector, in all ministries and agencies, and requires taking the necessary steps to do this. The amendment gives the government authority to allot specific positions to Arab employees and to obligate government ministries and agencies to submit an annual report on implementation of the amendment and the proportion of Arab employees in the department;
- Amendment 11 (2000) to the Government Companies Law, which mandates that boards of directors of government corporations give adequate representation to the Arab population and instructs ministers to appoint Arab directors whenever possible, until the goal of fair representation is achieved.
- A 2005 amendment to Article 15A of the Public Service Law (Appointments) that requires affirmative action for Ethiopian Israelis applying for public service jobs.
- A complementary bill requiring adequate representation for Arab employees in manufacturing firms was tabled during the sixteenth and seventeenth Knessets, but failed to pass.

In contrast to the situation with regard to affirmative action, Israeli law clearly recognizes the principle of prohibition of discrimination in employment as an international norm as well as a norm anchored in domestic legislation. Israel is a signatory to most of the existing international conventions dealing with the prohibition of discrimination in employment, and over the years the Law of

Equal Employment Opportunities of 1988 has been amended to include the prohibition of discrimination on the basis of gender, parenthood, family status, ethnic group, belief, country of origin and age. In addition to legislation that prohibits discrimination, there is also legislation pertaining to specific social groups - women, persons with disabilities, and demobilized soldiers - that prohibits discrimination and also provides for a certain degree of affirmative action in employment. In 2007, an Equal Employment Opportunities Commission was created for the very purpose of eliminating discrimination in employment.

BEST PRACTICES AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Civil Society Initiatives

1. Focus on best practice: a combination of employability training and job placement

a. Focus more on the new skills provided and on the quality, rather than number, of placements made.

Job placements are often short-lived and they do not always improve the standard of living of participants. Thus, any evaluation of placement efforts needs to be done on a long-term basis and be based on the concept of progress.

b. Support programs that involve both job placement and training.

Both training programs and placement programs contribute to the employment possibilities of minorities. However, the winning strategy appears to be a combination of job placement and on-the-job training.

Especially among Ethiopian immigrants but also among Arabs, there is a sense of weariness from what are sometimes perceived as "theoretical programs" and a desire for practical job solutions.

2. Expand the notion of excellence

Expand programs based on excellence so as to include a wider range of workers: excelling high school graduates in vocational tracks, skilled workers who are not university graduates, students during their period of study, etc.

Meanwhile, it is essential to pursue efforts focused on the training and placement of rank and file workers.

3. Expand and diversify successful vocational training models

a. Expand training programs and initiatives that fit the traditional skills and way of life of certain social groups, utilizing existing resources such as the guest house program for Druze and Circassians in the North, the Bedouin cooperatives in the Negev, and the Maan cooperatives in Arab localities.

b. Expand programs that combine vocational training with business training, maximizing the options.

4. Continue making resources available to non-profits and grassroots R&D

Continue targeting grants for advocacy, innovation and experimentation in order to ensure that civil society organizations continue to develop new ideas, new policies and new programs, rather than focusing exclusively on service provision.

Private Sector Initiatives

Until quite recently, there was no expectation that the private sector engage in non-discriminatory hiring initiatives. It is only in the last year or two that the Israeli government has begun to partner in joint ventures with non-profits and the private sector in the design of affirmative action and non-discriminatory programs.

1. Continue Awareness Raising

a. Work with employers' associations to raise awareness.

Over the last three years, the government has been working with employers to promote affirmative action through awareness-raising conferences. These activities can be pursued much further, especially to encourage the wide-scale employment of Arab workers.

b. Continue to partner with the government and the non-profit sector to promote joint initiatives.

Among employer associations, awareness of the need for affirmative action is a new phenomenon, and it is phrased in economic and organizational terms as the integration of broader sectors of the population into the labor market and as diversification of the labor force.

c. Broaden the scope of awareness raising efforts.

Awareness raising need not be limited to senior management and resource/manpower managers, as is the current practice. Efforts need

to be made to reach middle- range managers as well as rank-and-file workers, so as to ensure receptive attitudes throughout company hierarchies. Moreover, within government and mixed companies and in the industrial sector, it may prove desirable to work with workers' committees, as these have significant influence on the hiring, firing and reception of new workers.

2. Use the US Experience to Promote Non-discriminatory Hiring Practices in Israel

Use the US and European multi-nationals' concept of corporate responsibility to promote affirmative action in Israel.

Benchmarks can be established for different levels of the organization with regard to different population groups, and the requirement of periodic reporting on progress made can also be instituted.

3. Employ Economic Incentives

- a. Partner with the government and business sectors to promote economic incentives for employers**, especially in the industrial sector in the North of Israel, with Arab workers, where this strategy has already proved successful. These initiatives were halted in 2008 and should be renewed.
- b. Target incentives to localities, not to population groups, so as to avoid stigmatization.**

Incentives may stigmatize employees from minority groups. One possible solution is to create employer incentives targeted at specific localities in which these immigrants form a majority. For example, as Or Akiva is a community dominated by Caucasian immigrants, incentives can be directed at employers in the nearby industrial area, who can be encouraged to engage a certain percentage of workers from this development town.

4. Revise the selection processes

Support efforts to revise the employee selection process to make it culturally diverse.

Prodded by advocacy organizations, private companies and placement agencies have just begun to revise the battery of tests and interviews that precede hiring, so that they are culturally appropriate for persons from minority groups. This direction of change could benefit the groups under discussion.

Government Initiatives

a. Support and strengthen government action

It should be borne in mind that Israel is a small country in which power is concentrated in the central government. The central government is the only body that has the capacity to promote employment policy on a large scale, from both the standpoint of funding and that of planning. The potential of the private sector to finance social change programs is quite small and Diaspora Jewry cannot be expected to act as an alternative to the government of Israel.

b. Keep in mind the need to secure the sustainability of the Tevet programs.

A problem foreseen by many of the non-profits participating in the Tevet programs, as well as by JDC Tevet people, is its sustainability. In view of government retrenchment, the question is whether or not public agencies will take over Tevet projects that prove successful.

c. Support Development Prerequisites.

Government efforts to increase the workforce participation of Arab citizens will probably make only a limited impact until the major structural obstacles are removed; the reference is to the lack of public transportation, childcare and industrial enterprises in Arab localities. This is especially relevant for the Bedouin community in the Negev.

d. Partner with government to promote development incentives.

Joint Jewish-Arab industrial parks not only contribute to increased employment opportunities in the Arab sector but also contribute to the de-segregation of the Arab labor market. Efforts need to be made to expand this strategy.

The strategy of "national priority areas" that gives economic benefits to investors can be used on a wider scale in Arab localities to boost new initiatives.

4. Legislation for Active Anti-discrimination Practices

a. Support efforts to legislate active anti-discrimination practices.

The principle of anti-discrimination in employment is well anchored in Israeli law. However, most legislation is declarative in nature and deals with outlawing discrimination. Sanctions for the violation of anti-discrimination laws are not well developed. Legislation and regulations that do mandate affirmative action are limited to stipulating percentages without referring to positions or rank. These cover only some parts of the civil service and are not relevant for the private sector. The biggest problem is the weakness of enforcement and the inability to deal with structural discrimination.

A number of laws that do not exist in Israel or that exist but require improvement would serve to promote affirmative action:

- Outlawing employment discrimination in basic law on the normative, declarative level;
- Promoting transparent legislation requiring the collection of data on minority groups, and/or the requirement of submitting periodic reports.

A step in this direction was taken with the establishment of the Equal Employment Opportunities Commission (2007), which has the authority to issue orders mandating employers to submit data on representation and on affirmative action undertaken.

- Broadening the legal definition of "adequate representation" in the public sector so as to include goals like representation in posts requiring a college education and in managerial posts, as well as the imposition of sanctions for not meeting affirmative action goals;
- Conditioning government procurement of private services and the bestowal of financial benefits on adequate representation of minority groups.

It is common practice in other parts of the world to vary such requirements with the size of the firm and its centrality;

b. Support efforts to strengthen enforcement mechanisms

Enforcement mechanisms, especially with regard to the low-wage labor market, in which Arab citizens and new immigrants are found in large numbers, clearly need to be strengthened.

Agents of reinforcement include the newly created Equal Employment Opportunities Commission and the employment inspectors at the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment.

REFERENCES

Amzaleg-Bahar, Haya and Yafe-Argaz, Dganit. 2006. *Learning from Success in the Absorption of Immigrants, Concluding Report*. Mitveh Consulting, Evaluation and Placement. Jerusalem.

Awad, Yaser and Haider, Ali. 2008. *Representation of the Arab Population in the Civil Service 2006-2007*. Sikkuy. Jerusalem and Haifa.

Awad, Yaser. 2007. "Fair Representation, Affirmative Action and Employment Equality" in Haider, Ali. (ed.). 2007. *2006 Sikkuy Annual Report*. Jerusalem and Haifa.

Bank of Israel. 2008. *Annual Report 2007*. Jerusalem.

Bank of Israel. August 2007. *Recent Economic Developments (January-June 2007)*. Report No. 118. Jerusalem.

Blachman, Israel. 2006. "Mizrahim (Oriental Jews) in the Academic Staff of Israeli Research Universities." M.A. Thesis. Tel Aviv University.

Council for Higher Education. 2002. *Report of the Sub-Committee of the Planning and Budgeting Committee on the Promotion of Arab Higher Education*. www.che.org.il.

Dichter, Shalom and Ghanem, Asad. (eds.). 2003. *The Sikkuy Report 2002-2003*. Jerusalem, and Haifa.

Habib, Jack. 2006. "The Integration of Caucasian Immigrants in Israel: General Outlook". A presentation from the Conference, "Research on Community in Change: The Absorption of Caucasian Immigrants in Israel: Evaluation and Planning."

Haider, Ali. (ed.). 2007. *2006 Sikkuy Annual Report*. Jerusalem and Haifa.

Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews. 2008. "Integration of Ethiopian Israelis into the Civil Service." www.iaej.co.il

Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews. February 14, 2006. "Difficulties in the Absorption of Ethiopian College Graduates in the Labor Market and Recommendations." www.iaej.co.il.

Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews. May 25, 2007. "Ethiopian Israelis in the Labor Market." www.iaej.co.il.

JDC, Immigrant Absorption Department. 2007. *Summary of Activities for the Year 2006*. Jerusalem.

- JDC. 2008. *Tevet Employment Initiative Update Report*
- Khatib, Mahmud and Solomon Shimi. July 2006. *Small Businesses in the Arab Sector: Comparative Empirical Study*. Koret Economic Development Funds.
- King, Judith, Alnavogen-Frankowitz, Sarit, Sorek, Yoel and Dolev, Tal. 2005. *The Integration of Caucasian Immigrants in Israel*. Research Summary. Myers-JDC-Brookdale Foundation.
- Knesset Absorption Committee. March 10, 2008. "5 Year Program for the Absorption of Ethiopian Immigrants." Protocol No. 180.
- Knesset Absorption Committee. October 10, 2007. "Representation of Immigrants in the National Insurance Institute." Protocol No. 123.
- Kristal, Meirav. October 21st, 2007. "Present/Absent. Israeli Arabs Rarely Appear in the Hebrew Media. When They Do- It's in an Intimidating Context. In Addition, Most Media Channels do not Employ Arabs". *Ynet.co.il*.
- Lansky, Naama. October 11, 2007. "In Channel 2 News They Agreed to Hire an Arab- With the Condition that His Salary be Paid by an Organization Founded by MK Malchior from Meimad". *TheMarker, Haaretz*.
- Levy, Shelly. June 2006. *Discrimination of Arab Citizens in Employment in the Private Sector*. The Knesset Research and Information Center.
- Markowitz, Henia. 2007. *Adequate Representation of Arab and Druze Citizens as well as Circassians, in the Civil Service: 2006 Report*. Civil Service Commission, Planning and Control Division.
- Ministry of Absorption. February 10, 2008. "Today the Government Approved a Comprehensive Plan for Better Absorption of Ethiopian Immigrants and Their Integration into Israeli Society." Press Release.
- Ministry of Absorption. May 13, 2007. "Absorption of Ethiopian Immigrants in the Civil Service." Press Release.
- Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment. 2004. *Participation of Arab Women in the Labor Force in the Past Decade*.
- Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment. 2007. The Inter-Ministerial Committee for the Development of an Aid Program for Israeli Ethiopians. *Report of the Sub-committee on the Absorption of Young Ethiopian Israelis in the Labor Market*. Jerusalem.
- Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment. April 1st 2008. Memorandum to Adva Center.

National Insurance Institute and JDC-Brookdale Institute. February 2008. *Evaluation of Mehalev Program. Report No. 6.* Jerusalem.

National Insurance Institute and JDC-Brookdale Institute. July 2007. *Evaluation of Mehalev Program. Report No.4* Jerusalem.

Oltzwer, Amos. June 2004. *The Policy of the Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment Towards the Development of Industry and Employment in the Arab Sector.* The Knesset Research and Information Center.

Port2Port. February 20, 2008. "The Industrialists: Within 5 years 1,000 Ethiopian Israelis will be Integrated into the Manufacturing Sector."
<http://www.port2port.co.il>.

Shtern, Yoav and Sinai, Ruth. March 30, 2008. "Percentage of Arab Employees in the Civil Service is 5.6%; Percentage of Women only 2%". *Haaretz*.

Shtewee Ola. 2008. *Participation of Arab Women in the Labor Market.* Women's Budget Forum. www.wbf.org.il.

The Government Companies Authority. *2006 Annual Report.* www.gca.gov.il.

The State Comptroller. 2008. *Annual Report 58b for the Year 2007.* Jerusalem.

Walda-Tsadik, Abraham. 2003. *Labor Supply of Ethiopian Immigrants in Israel: A Model of Employment and Participation.* M.A. Thesis. Tel Aviv
www.wbf.org.ilUniversity.

Interviews

March 16, 2008. Dani Admaso, Director of the Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews.

March 25, 2008, Assaf Adiv, Director of Ma'an - Worker's Advice Center.

March 30, 2008. Shoshana Ron, Director of the Covenant of Bukharans in Israel.

April 2, 2008. Eti Zur, Director of Counseling and Placement Services, Government Employment Service.

April 13, 2008. Ibrahim Katane, Deputy Director-General of Kav-Mashveh.

April 22, 2008. Atef Abu-Ajaj, Director, Economic Development and Employment Programs, Nisped-Ajeek.

April 22, 2008. Amal Elsana-Alh'jooj, Director of Ajeec.

April 30, 2008. Dr. Sigal Shelach, Director, Programs for Immigrants and Minorities, Tevet, JDC.

April 30, 2008. Beni Feferman, Head of Human Resources Planning Authority, Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment.

June 1, 2008. Abramov Robert, Deputy Mayor, Municipality of Or-Akiva.

October 5th, 2008. Irit Tamir, attorney, Director-General of Kav-Mashveh.

October 5th, 2008. Ifat Ovadia, manager, "Olim Beyahad" project.

Appendix 1

Countrywide and Regional Organizations Encouraging on-Discriminatory Hiring Practices, by Target Population

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
1. GENERAL PUBLIC OR SEVERAL TARGET GROUPS					
<p>Adva Center</p> <p>www.adva.org</p> <p>Located in Tel Aviv</p>	<p>Founded in 1991. Action-oriented Israeli policy analysis center monitoring inequality and conducting public education projects.</p>	<p>Disadvantaged groups: Arab citizens, women, new immigrants, etc.</p>	<p>*Researching employment and related issues concerning disadvantaged groups;</p> <p>*Advocating for policy changes in favor of disadvantaged groups in many areas,</p>	<p>* Policy analysis;</p> <p>* Advocacy;</p> <p>* Popular education.</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Initiator of Women's Budget Forum.</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
			<p>including employment;</p> <p>*Conducting a budget analysis program;</p> <p>*Operating popular education programs on a variety of socio-economic issues, among them employment.</p>		

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>Ahoti</p> <p>www.ahoti.org.il</p> <p>Located in Tel Aviv</p>	<p>Established in 1999 as a Mizrahi feminist movement to voice and address the needs of women in the social periphery of Israel.</p>	<p>Mizrahi women, including Ethiopian women</p>	<p>*Operating a women's community kitchen in Jerusalem;</p> <p>*Training women in small business initiatives and supporting a group of women immigrants from Bukhara;</p> <p>*Operating a feminist shop selling products of Ethiopian artists from the development town of Kiryat Gat.</p>	<p>*Entrepreneurship training and monitoring;</p> <p>*Marketing assistance.</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Membership in Women's Budget Forum</p>
<p>Be-atzmi</p> <p>www.be-atzmi.org.il</p>	<p>Founded in 1995. Target is integration of unemployed and poor people into the labor market.</p>	<p>Poor, unemployed</p>	<p>*Conducting group seminars on entrepreneurship and individual mentoring;</p> <p>*Creating pools of</p>	<p>*Entrepreneurship training;</p> <p>*Job placement;</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
Located in Jaffa			<p>employers and support networks;</p> <p>*Operating Tevet programs: "Eshet Chayil" and "Avi Chayil" for Ethiopian immigrants in 16 locations & a program for poor Ethiopian families in 8 communities; operating the "Strive" program in Tel Aviv;</p> <p>*Operating a variety of employment programs for older workers and for young workers in rural communities.</p>	<p>*Monitoring of job placement;</p> <p>*Employability training and empowerment;</p> <p>*Vocational training.</p>	Contractor for Tevet

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>Economic Empowerment of Women</p> <p>www.womensown.org.il</p> <p>Located in Haifa</p>	<p>Founded in 1997 by feminist activists with the aim of promoting the socio-economic independence of women through small businesses.</p>	<p>Low-income women</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Conducting the micro-credit project "A Business of Her Own"; *Conducting empowerment courses; *Providing business mentoring, in collaboration with Mati centers and other NGOs. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Micro-entrepreneurship; *Business mentoring and training; *Employability empowerment. 	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Cooperates with Mati centers, Koret Development Funds, Hapoalim Bank & other NGOs</p>
<p>Israel Women's Network</p> <p>www.iwn.org.il</p>	<p>Established in 1984; devoted to improving the status of women in Israel.</p>	<p>Women in Israel</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Operating the Tevet "Eshet Chayil" program for Caucasian and Bukharan women; * Advocating for women's employment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Advocacy- legal & parliamentary; *Legal aid on workplace issues relevant to women. 	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Contractor for Tevet</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
Located in Tel Aviv			rights and against gender discrimination; *Providing legal aid on workplace rights to individual women; *Key player in the establishment of the Commission for Equal Employment Opportunities in 2007.		
Itach – Women Lawyers for Social Justice www.itach.org.il	Founded in 2001 by feminist legal professionals. Committed to promoting social justice for women through legal action. Focuses on employment rights, welfare benefits, public housing and reducing violence	Low-income women	*Providing legal aid to individual women on employment and welfare issues, including workplace discrimination; *Operating a legal hotline;	*Advocacy; *Employability training and empowerment; *Legal aid on employment, social security, welfare and housing.	Independent NGO Member of coalitions: Women's Budget Forum & Forum for Enforcement of Workers' Rights.

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
3 offices: Tel Aviv, Beer-Sheba, Haifa	against women.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Advocating for women's rights; *Conducting courses for women to promote access to the courts. 		
<p>Kav Laoved</p> <p>www.kavlaoved.org.il</p> <p>4 offices: Tel Aviv, Beer Sheba, Jerusalem, Haifa</p>	<p>Founded in 1991. Protecting the rights of disadvantaged workers employed in Israel, and Israelis in the Occupied Territories, including Palestinians, migrant workers, subcontracted workers and new immigrants.</p>	Workers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Advocating for fair employment policies and workers' rights; exposure of employment discrimination. *Legal aid on workplace rights. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Advocacy – legal and policy; *Legal aid to secure or redress workers' rights. 	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>*Initiator (with the Adva Center) of the Forum for Enforcement of Worker's Rights, a coalition of 5 organizations.</p>
<p>Mahut Center-Information, Guidance and</p>	<p>Founded in 2004. Concentrates on employment empowerment for low-income women, Jewish</p>	Low-income women in the North	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Conducting employment empowerment courses for poor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Employability empowerment and training; 	Independent NGO

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>Employment for Women</p> <p>Located in Haifa.</p>	<p>and Arab.</p>		<p>women;</p> <p>*Conducting employability training: computer literacy, job seeking skills;</p> <p>* Arranging vocational training for women in cooperation with private training institutions;</p> <p>*Job placement and mentoring.</p>	<p>*Job placement;</p> <p>*Monitoring.</p>	<p>Contractor for Tevet</p>
<p>Supportive Community-Women's Business Development Center</p>	<p>Established in 2003 by a group of recent Soviet immigrant business women. Mission is to assist women in setting up small businesses to improve their socio-economic status.</p>	<p>Women in Israel</p>	<p>*Providing individual and group business consultation and mentoring;</p> <p>*Assisting women to access loans, in</p>	<p>*Encouragement of small business entrepreneurship;</p> <p>*Business support services.</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>www.svivotomehet.org.il</p> <p>Located in Tel Aviv</p>			<p>cooperation with Koret Funds;</p> <p>*Organizing fairs and trade shows to promote marketing of the products of participants and graduates.</p>		
<p>The Association for Civil Rights in Israel</p> <p>www.acri.org.il</p> <p>3 offices: Jerusalem, Tel Aviv, Haifa</p>	<p>Founded in 1972. Promotes civil and socio-economic rights in Israel and in the Territories.</p>	<p>All citizens and inhabitants</p>	<p>*Advocating for human rights, employment rights and anti-discrimination through litigation, parliamentary lobbying, media campaigns and education programs in schools;</p> <p>*Publishing reports on</p>	<p>*Advocacy on employment and other social policy issues;</p> <p>*Legal aid on workplace rights and workplace discrimination (and many other issues).</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Participation in coalitions: Forum for Enforcement of Workers' Rights, Women's Budget Forum.</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
			<p>human rights violations in Israel and the Territories;</p> <p>*Formulating bills and court appeals on equal opportunity for Arab citizens;</p> <p>* Providing legal aid in individual cases of discrimination.</p>		
<p>Women's Budget Forum</p> <p>www.wbf.org.il</p>	<p>Established in 2004 as a coalition of women's and human rights organizations to work for women's fair share of the budget.</p>	<p>Women in Israel</p>	<p>*Advocating for gender-responsive budgeting;</p> <p>*Advocating for specific changes in the national budget</p>	<p>*Advocacy in parliament & government offices;</p> <p>* Circulation of position papers;</p> <p>* Capacity-building</p>	<p>Coalition of 30 organizations</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>Located in Tel Aviv</p>			<p>that benefit women;</p> <p>* Among the focus areas: removing employment barriers for Arab women & obtaining vocational training for low-income women.</p>	<p>for members;</p> <p>*Outreach work.</p>	
<p>Yedid: Association for Community Empowerment</p> <p>www.yedid.org.il</p> <p>18 centers</p>	<p>Established in 1997 to promote social and economic justice in Israel through empowerment of underprivileged populations.</p>	<p>Low-income Israelis</p>	<p>*Operating rights and empowerment centers for low-income Israelis throughout the country;</p> <p>*Advocating in Knesset & the media on welfare, housing, food security, employment and unemployment;</p>	<p>*Legal rights centers;</p> <p>*Advocacy;</p> <p>*Courses to improve home finance and work-seeking skills.</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Contractor for Tevet</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
			<p>*Operating a mobile rights and health center in the Arab sector in the North;</p> <p>*Conducting job-seeking skills courses & empowerment groups for low-income and single parent women & a small business awareness program.</p>		
2. ARAB CITIZENS AND CO-EXISTENCE					
<p>Adalah, The Legal Center for Arab Minority Rights in Israel.</p>	<p>Founded in 1996. Works to achieve equal individual and collective rights for the Arab minority in Israel in different fields,</p>	<p>Arabs in Israel</p>	<p>*Initiating litigation on employment and related issues, such as economic development, resource allocation</p>	<p>*Legal and media advocacy;</p> <p>* Legal aid & litigation on workplace rights.</p>	<p>Independent NGO.</p> <p>Membership in coalition: Women's Budget Forum</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>www.adalah.org</p> <p>Located in Haifa</p>	<p>including land rights; civil and political rights; cultural, social, and economic rights; religious rights; women's rights; and prisoners' rights.</p>		<p>and National Insurance benefits;</p> <p>*Providing consultations to individuals, non-governmental organizations, and Arab institutions.</p> <p>*Advocating vis-à-vis state authorities regarding the rights of the Arab minority.</p>		
<p>Ajeek- Arab Jewish Center for Equality, Empowerment & Cooperation</p>	<p>Established by the Negev Institute for Strategies of Peace & Development in 2000. Acts to promote socio-economic development of Arabs, with the target of achieving equality</p>	<p>Arabs, notably Bedouins in the Negev</p> <p>Arab-Jewish cooperation</p>	<p>*Collecting data on the employment and development of Arab Bedouins in the Negev;</p> <p>*Conducting vocational training</p>	<p>*Advocacy on employment and development in the Negev;</p> <p>*Vocational training & employability</p>	<p>Part of the Negev Institute for Strategies of Peace & Development.</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>www.nisped.org.il</p> <p>Located in Beer Sheba</p>	<p>and cooperation between Arabs and Jews in Israel.</p>		<p>courses combined with entrepreneurship for Bedouin women and men in the Negev, in cooperation with Tevet and the Ministry of Labor;</p> <p>*Initiating and supporting local businesses based on traditional skills (Lakiya weaving and jewelry workshop, Hura catering for single mothers, sheep breeders' corporation);</p> <p>*Established an Arab Bedouin business</p>	<p>empowerment;</p> <p>*Entrepreneurship-training & organizational support;</p> <p>*Mentoring and monitoring.</p>	<p>Contractor for Tevet</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
			forum in the Negev.		
<p>Al Ahali Center for Community Development</p> <p>www.ahali.org</p> <p>Located in Nazareth.</p>	<p>Established in 1999 to promote grassroots activism among Arabs in Israel. Most projects are concentrated in the fields of education and employment.</p>	<p>Arab citizens</p>	<p>* Founding & supporting an association of Arab farmers, the aim of which is to upgrade their products and production;</p> <p>* Training and supporting rural women in agriculture, focusing on creating small businesses involving traditional agricultural products, like olive oil and herbs.</p>	<p>*Advocacy on agricultural issues;</p> <p>*Employability training and empowerment;</p> <p>*Encouraging entrepreneurship.</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Membership in Women's Budget Forum</p>
<p>I'lam Media Center for Arab</p>	<p>Founded in 2000 by Arab journalists and academics. Targets are democratization of the</p>	<p>Arab citizens & especially</p>	<p>*Operating a Media Rights Program-advocacy and</p>	<p>*Advocacy on media representation of Arab citizens;</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>Palestinians in Israel</p> <p>www.ilamcenter.org</p> <p>Located in Nazareth</p>	<p>Israeli media, promotion of fair and equal treatment of Arab citizens in the media and achieving equal access to the Israeli media.</p>	<p>Arab journalists</p>	<p>monitoring of the coverage of the Arab sector by Israeli media;</p> <p>* Operating training programs for Arab journalists and assisting with their integration into mainstream media.</p>	<p>*Empowerment training of Arab journalists;</p> <p>*Assistance and monitoring of job placement.</p>	
<p>Kayan Feminist Organization</p> <p>www.kayan.org</p> <p>Located in Haifa</p>	<p>Founded in 1998. Works to empower Arab women in all fields, with an emphasis on education and employment.</p>	<p>Arab Women in Israel, mainly in the North and Center.</p>	<p>*Advocating a development policy that will encourage the employment of Arab women, addressing issues such as mobility problems & gender roles in the household;</p>	<p>*Advocacy;</p> <p>*Employability empowerment;</p> <p>*Mentoring programs;</p> <p>*Legal aid on workplace rights.</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Membership in Women's Budget Forum</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
			*Conducting empowerment courses for Arab women on employment issues; *Providing individual legal aid on employment rights.		
Ma'an- Forum of Bedouin Women's Organizations in the Negev Located in Beer Sheba.	Founded in 2001, Ma'an is a coalition of 12 organizations active in the Negev region. Focus is on personal status, education and the employment of Bedouin women in the Negev.	Arab Bedouin women in the Negev.	*Publishing periodic reports and conducting conferences on the employment and welfare status of Bedouin women; *Assisting organizations active in the field of employment.	*Advocacy on the status of Bedouin women, especially on employment issues.	A coalition of NGO'S

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>Mossawa Center</p> <p>www.mossawa.org</p> <p>Located in Haifa</p>	<p>Established in 1997. An advocacy center working to promote the political, social and economic rights of Arabs in Israel.</p>	<p>Arabs in Israel</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Advocating in the Knesset and government; *Analyzing budgets allocated to the Arab sector; *Conducting public information campaigns. 	<p>Advocacy on budget allocations and economic development.</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Membership in Women's Budget Forum</p>
<p>Sawt-el-Amel (The Laborer's Voice)</p> <p>www.laborers-voice.org</p>	<p>Founded in 2000. Works to promote the rights of Arab citizens in Israel to work and receive social security; strives to eradicate discrimination against Arabs in the North of Israel</p>	<p>Mainly Arabs, workers and unemployed living in the North of Israel.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Monitoring "Mahalev" (welfare-to-work program); *Conducting legal and parliamentary advocacy on unemployment issues; *Operating a forum for Arab women on 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Advocacy on employment and social security issues; *Legal aid on workplace rights; *Employability empowerment of workers. 	<p>Independent NGO</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
Located in Nazareth			employment.		
<p>Sikkuy, The Association for the Advancement of Civic Equality in Israel</p> <p>www.sikkuy.org.il</p> <p>2 offices: Haifa and Jerusalem</p>	<p>Founded in 1991 as a Jewish-Arab advocacy organization; promotes equality between Jews and Arabs, as well as shared citizenship.</p>	<p>Arabs in Israel</p>	<p>*Monitoring and promoting civic equality programs in the public and private sectors;</p> <p>*Advocating employment equity and fair representation of Arab citizens in the public and private sectors;</p> <p>*Operating a database of Arab college graduates and a want-ads service;</p> <p>*Promoting municipal cooperation between</p>	<p>*Advocacy- legal, parliamentary & among employers;</p> <p>*Job-seeking assistance.</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
			neighboring Jewish and Arab communities, including promotion of shared industrial zones.		
<p>The Center for Jewish-Arab Economic Development</p> <p>www.cjaed.org.il</p> <p>Located in Herzliya</p>	<p>Founded in 1988 by Arab and Jewish business people. The center strives to promote economic development and economic cooperation between Arabs and Jews.</p>	<p>Arab citizens</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Creating networks of Arab and Jewish businesspeople and promoting joint ventures; *Conducting entrepreneurship training and mentoring in the Arab sector; *Operating a loan fund for small businesses set up by women to assist Arab 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Entrepreneurship support; *Business mentoring; *Loan fund operation; *Advocacy. 	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Cooperates with government agencies & Mati centers.</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
			business persons in accessing credit; *Operating a unique MBA program in which Jewish and Arab Israeli students learn alongside their Palestinian counterparts, in English, at Haifa University.		
3. ETHIOPIAN IMMIGRANTS					
Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews	Founded in 1994 to promote the integration of Ethiopian Jews into Israeli society.	Ethiopian Jews	*Monitoring the absorption of Ethiopian Jews into Israel;	*Advocacy-parliamentary, within government offices and among	Independent NGO Contractor for Tevet

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
www.aiej.co.il Located in Jerusalem			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Advocating vis-à-vis government and parliament; *Operating an employment program for university graduates, with Yedid, matching job seekers with employers; *Establishing an Employer's Council to promote hiring of Ethiopian Jews. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> employers; *Employability empowerment and training; *Job placement. 	

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>Tebeka - Advocacy for Equality and Justice for Ethiopian Israelis</p> <p>www.tebeka.org.il</p> <p>3 offices: Tel Aviv, Rehovot, Netanya</p>	<p>Founded in 1999 by lawyers Tebeka ("justice") is a legal aid and advocacy organization engaged in protecting the civil rights of Ethiopian Israelis and promoting social justice and integration.</p>	<p>Ethiopian Jews</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * Providing legal aid on employment issues via empowerment seminars on legal rights; *Anti discrimination advocacy; * Operating a job placement program assisting Law School graduates to find clerking positions and jobs in prestigious law firms; *Operating an empowerment program for young Ethiopian professionals. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Employability empowerment; * Job placement; *Advocacy- general, legal; *Legal aid on workplace rights. 	<p>Independent NGO</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>Tech Career</p> <p>(no website, for details see www.aiej.co.il).</p> <p>Located in Kibbutz Nahshon</p>	<p>Established in 2003. Engages in computer training and placement of Ethiopian youngsters in the high-tech industry.</p>	<p>Young, talented Ethiopian immigrants</p>	<p>*Conducting a one-year training program, under boarding-school conditions in a kibbutz, including placement of graduates in jobs and follow-up;</p> <p>*Conducting short courses for various high-tech professions.</p>	<p>*Vocational training;</p> <p>*Employability training;</p> <p>*Job placement.</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p> <p>Cooperation with the John Bryce, Microsoft and Matrix corporations.</p> <p>As of 2008, the Ministry of Industry is a partner to the project</p>
<p>Telem Program of the kibbutz movement</p>	<p>Integrates young Ethiopian immigrants into the workforce and increases integration of Ethiopian Israelis into Israeli society.</p>	<p>Ethiopian Israelis after army service</p>	<p>Operating a one-year intensive study and work program in a kibbutz.</p>	<p>*Employability training;</p> <p>*Vocational training;</p> <p>*Support services.</p>	<p>The program is supported by the Ministry of Absorption. Main sponsor: International Fellowship of Christians and Jews</p>
<p>Zinuk B'aliyah</p>	<p>Began as a project of Tebeka; established as a</p>	<p>Ethiopian Jews</p>		<p>*Employability training</p>	<p>Independent NGO</p>

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
<p>Located in Tel Aviv</p>	<p>separate organization in 2006. Aims to integrate Ethiopian academics into high-income, prestigious positions and create a well-connected Ethiopian leadership.</p>		<p>*Conducting employability and empowerment courses for university graduates (business English, marketing skills etc.);</p> <p>*Advocating among employers;</p> <p>*Job placement of program graduates and follow-up.</p>	<p>and empowerment;</p> <p>*Advocacy among employers;</p> <p>*Job placement and subsequent monitoring.</p>	

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
4. IMMIGRANTS FROM THE CAUCASUS AND BUKHARA					
World Congress of Bukharan Jews Located in Ramat Gan.	Founded by Lev Levaiev, the Congress serves as a roof organization for the Bukharan community in Israel.	Bukharan immigrants	*Operating employment centers and vocational training programs, in cooperation with local authorities (Ramle and Bat Yam as examples).	*Employment support & job training.	Independent NGO
Covenant of Bukharans in Israel	Set up in 1972 to represent the Bukharan community in Israel.	Bukharan immigrants	*Operating an employment center; * Offering workshops that prepare job seekers for work	*Employability training; *Job placement.	Independent NGO

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
Located in Tel Aviv			interviews.		
Association of Caucasian Jews, 2006 Located in Netanya	Founded in 2006 by young Caucasians, in an attempt to replace the old leadership and serve as a roof organization for the Caucasian community in Israel.	Caucasian immigrants			Independent NGO
Keshev www.keshev-k.com	A self-help organization founded in 2006 by young Caucasian immigrants. Works to integrate young people from the Caucasian	Caucasian immigrants	*Operating an internet forum on employment, including job ads, guidance in CV-writing and job-	*Assistance with job seeking.	Independent NGO

Name & Website	Background, Targets	Target population	Activities to promote non-discriminatory employment practices	Strategies	Type of organization
Located in Or Akiva	community into higher education, military service (women) and employment.		seeking.		

Appendix 2

Non-Discriminatory Initiatives Undertaken by Government

FOR ARAB ISRAELIS	FOR ETHIOPIAN ISRAELIS	FOR CAUCASIAN & BUKHARAN ISRAELIS
1. Development and Infrastructure Initiatives		
<p>In 2000: 4-year plan for industrial development in the Arab sector.</p> <p><u>Implementation</u>: partial, 30% of budget used.</p>	<p>In 2008: Government decision on the initiation of a 5-year absorption plan, including an employment plan.</p> <p><u>Implementation</u>: Nil to date.</p>	<p>In 1995: Inter-ministerial committee decided to define Caucasian immigrants and their offspring as a special group and give it special privileges, like increasing the period during which they would be entitled to immigrant rights (to ten years) and providing special assistance for students.</p>
<p>In 2006: 4-year plan for the development of Arab, Druze and Circassian Israelis in the North.</p> <p><u>Implementation</u>: ongoing.</p> <p>Employer incentives partially implemented but halted in 2008. One Arab locality joined 3 Jewish localities in</p>		<p>In 1998: Ministry of Absorption set up department for the absorption of Bukharan immigrants.</p> <p>In 1999: Bukharan immigrants were made a priority population.</p> <p>Cabinet committee chaired by Minister Nathan Sharansky decided on special</p>

FOR ARAB ISRAELIS	FOR ETHIOPIAN ISRAELIS	FOR CAUCASIAN & BUKHARAN ISRAELIS
<p>the Bar-Lev industrial area.</p> <p>Guest house project for Druze and Circassians was implemented by Ministry of Tourism and still continues.</p>		<p>help for Bukharan immigrants making aliyah in 1990 or afterwards: broadened financial assistance, affirmative action programs in the areas of education and employment; bestowed priority status in admittance to vocational training courses in academic and well as non-academic professions; included special course in workplace Hebrew.</p>
<h2>2. Initiatives Centered on Public Sector Employment</h2>		
<p>Legislation: Amendment 11 (2000) of the Public Service Law (Appointments) mandated fair representation of Arabs in all ministries, government agencies and boards of directors of government corporations.</p>	<p>Legislation: 2005 amendment to Article 15A of the Public Service Law (Appointments) required affirmative action for Ethiopian Israelis applying for public service jobs.</p>	
<p>Public Service Commission issued detailed annual reports on the progress of absorption of Arab employees into the public service.</p>	<p>In May 2007: Government decision was made to hire 15 Ethiopian Israelis in senior positions in public service, and include incentives for units hiring them.</p>	

FOR ARAB ISRAELIS	FOR ETHIOPIAN ISRAELIS	FOR CAUCASIAN & BUKHARAN ISRAELIS
	<u>Implementation:</u> Full.	
In 2006: Arabs constituted 5.9% of public sector employees, compared with the government goal of 8.1%.	In 2006: 504 Ethiopian immigrants held public service jobs, constituting about 1% of public service employees.	
In 2003: Arabs constituted 5.9% of Boards of Directors of government corporations. In 2008, they constitute 10% of the same.		
Within government corporations, rank and file Arab workers estimated to constitute approximately 0.6% of employees.		
<p>In 2006: Inter-ministerial commission was established to examine options for increasing representation.</p> <p><u>Implementation:</u> Commission published a tender to head-hunt Arab workers for the public sector.</p>		
In 2006: Israel Electric Company , a government corporation, embarked upon an affirmative action initiative to	Police force: In September 2008: 560 Ethiopian Israelis were employed in the police force, out of a total of 28,000 employees. Recently, cooperation	

FOR ARAB ISRAELIS	FOR ETHIOPIAN ISRAELIS	FOR CAUCASIAN & BUKHARAN ISRAELIS
<p>hire more Arab workers.</p> <p><u>Implementation:</u> Program increased new hiring of Arab workers to 7-8% a year.</p>	<p>between the police and the Ministry of Absorption was initiated to increase recruitment of Ethiopian Israelis.</p>	
<p>Judicial System: In 2006: Government decision on affirmative action for Arab Israeli attorneys to be employed by the Ministry of Justice in 2009-2010.</p> <p><u>Implementation:</u> Database of candidates is being set up.</p>	<p>In 2006: Government decision made on affirmative action for Ethiopian Israeli attorneys to be employed by the Ministry of Justice in 2009-2010.</p> <p><u>Implementation:</u> Database of candidates is being created.</p>	
<p>Higher Education System: In 2002: Ma-of program for integrating Arab Ph.D. graduates in the sciences established.</p>		
<p>3. Initiatives Centered on Training and Placement</p>		
<p>In 2000: Resources allocated to vocational training for Arab Israelis as part of 4 year-plan.</p> <p><u>Implementation:</u> Partial, 65% of budget spent.</p>	<p>Government ministries (Employment, Education, Social Affairs) partner with the JDC and local authorities in the implementation of the Tevet programs: "Independence," "Idit,"</p>	<p>Government ministries (Employment, Education, Social Affairs) partner with the JDC and local authorities in the implementation of the Tevet programs: "Independence and</p>

FOR ARAB ISRAELIS	FOR ETHIOPIAN ISRAELIS	FOR CAUCASIAN & BUKHARAN ISRAELIS
	and "Kedma."	"Idit."
<p>In 2006: Additional resources allocated to vocational training for Arab Israelis as part of 4-year plan.</p> <p><u>Implementation:</u> In 2006: 2,890 Arabs participated in government vocational training courses, constituting 30% of all participants.</p>	<p>Basic employability training provided in absorption centers for unskilled immigrants, operated by the Ministry of Absorption and until 2007 by the "Be-Atzmi" non profit organization.</p>	<p>Since 2002: Ministry of Absorption, in conjunction with the JDC, has been conducting community leadership program for Bukharan and Caucasian immigrants, whose purpose is to develop a stratum of young activists in localities with high concentrations of new immigrants.</p>
	<p>Several dozen Ethiopian Israelis participate in special program conducted by Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment for unemployed persons who are not entitled to regular vocational training.</p>	<p>Mati centers developed special programs for new immigrants, among them new immigrants from Bukhara and the Caucasus. Since the end of the 1990s, Mati Hadera has been operating national projects for Caucasian immigrants whose manager is a Caucasian immigrant.</p>
	<p>Ministry of Absorption operates 6 vocational guidance centers throughout the country. No data available on implementation vis-à-vis Ethiopian Israelis.</p>	

FOR ARAB ISRAELIS	FOR ETHIOPIAN ISRAELIS	FOR CAUCASIAN & BUKHARAN ISRAELIS
	<p>Ministry of Industry, Commerce and Employment and the Ministry of Absorption operate a voucher program for new immigrants to be used in vocational training courses conducted by the private sector.</p> <p><u>Implementation:</u> To date, program has not been relevant for Ethiopian Israelis. It is currently being amended to encourage participation of Ethiopian immigrants.</p>	

Appendix 3

Non-Discriminatory Hiring Initiatives Undertaken by the Business Sector

FOR ARAB ISRAELIS	FOR ETHIOPIAN ISRAELIS
<p>Kav Mashveh – Employers' Coalition for Equality of Arab University Graduates</p> <p>www.kavmashve.org.il</p> <p>Located in Tel Aviv. A coalition of private employers, foundations and voluntary employers' organizations founded in 2007 to promote equal employment opportunities for Arab university graduates in the Israeli labor market.</p> <p><u>Main activities:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Building and operating a database of job-seekers and employers; * Placing Arab job-seekers in businesses (with emphasis on the private sector); *Creating support programs for job-seekers and for employers; *Advocating among employers to promote employment diversity. 	<p>Joint Forum of NGOs and industrialists from the Manufacturers' Association</p> <p>Established in 2007, Forum includes the Manufacturers' Association, Ministry of Absorption, Israel Association for Ethiopian Jews, Tabeka-Legal Center for Ethiopian Israelis, and North American Conference on Ethiopian Jews.</p> <p><u>Activity:</u> Forum developed program for in-plant training of unskilled workers in areas in which there is a shortage – metal working, computer micro-chip processing, tailoring, and machining. Goal: hiring 1,000 Ethiopian Israelis in manufacturing firms within five years.</p> <p>In August 2007: First course in metal welding opened its doors, in Ashkelon.</p>

FOR ARAB ISRAELIS	FOR ETHIOPIAN ISRAELIS
<p>Tsofen Elite Technologies</p> <p>www.tsofen.org</p> <p>Located in Nazareth. Founded in 2007 as an NGO composed of private business people and hi-tech entrepreneurs with the target of increasing number of Israeli Arab engineers in Israeli hi-tech sector, from the present level of 0.16% to 1% (in the Galilee) and from 300 engineers to 1300 (in Israel as a whole).</p> <p><u>Main activities:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> *Creating R&D centers in Nazareth that provide software development services to Israeli companies; * Training Arab university graduates in the hi-tech culture and its requirements. 	<p>Media course for Ethiopian Israelis</p> <p>Initiative of senior journalist Anat Saragosti. Project consists of a one-year course for aspiring Ethiopian journalists and community activists.</p> <p>Course is presently in its second round. Ethiopian journalists who managed to find work in the media are graduates of this course.</p>
<p>The Arab-Israeli Center for Technology and Hi-Tech</p> <p>Located in Nazareth. Founded in 2008 and led by former treasury official Dr.Yaron Zlich and the Zuabi family. Center's target is training and assimilating Arab university graduates into the hi-tech industry. Operations are to start in 2009 and include technological training courses and job placement in the hi-tech industry, in cooperation with "Kav Mashveh."</p>	

FOR ARAB ISRAELIS	FOR ETHIOPIAN ISRAELIS
<p>The Citizen's Accord Forum between Jews and Arabs in Israel</p> <p>www.caf.org.il</p> <p>Located in Jerusalem. Founded in 2000 by Jewish and Arab business people to promote equality between Jews and Arabs in Israel.</p> <p><u>Main activities:</u></p> <p>*Providing scholarships and training for young Arabs in the area of communication;.</p> <p>*Creating and operating a Jewish-Arab editors' committee and newsletter.</p>	

